



Approved

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, October 20, 2016

Room 250, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Christina Monk; Commissioners Emily Hilgendorf, Leslie Terry, Al Kopczyk, David Klavitter, Bob McDonell, John McAndrews and Joseph Rapp.

Commissioners Excused: Commissioner Juan Nieto.

Commissioners Unexcused: None.

Staff Members Present: David Johnson and Wally Wernimont.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Monk at 5:33 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Motion by McDonell, seconded by Hilgendorf, to approve the minutes of the July 21, 2016 meeting as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, McDonell, Monk, McAndrews, Rapp and Hilgendorf; Nay – None.

Design Review: Application of Patrick McTaggart, 1163 Highland Place, to accept the porch handrail as is or allow the handrail to be straightened in the W. 11th Street Historic District.

Staff Member Johnson presented the staff report, noting the alterations to the porch and history of land use. He explained the applicant is requesting the Commission either accept the handrail in its current design or allow the angled section in the middle be straightened.

Commissioner McDonell asked the applicant about the porch design and the angles of the handrail.

Commissioner Terry enter the meeting at 5:40 p.m.

Staff Member Johnson clarified the section of handrail under review is the middle section. Mr. McTaggart stated their previous contractor came up with his own design. They discussed the previous contractor's work and the inability to curve the rim board.

Commissioner McDonell asked the applicants if they prefer an angle or straight hand railing. The applicants stated they liked the angled handrail. Commissioner McDonell discussed angling the floor to meet the handrail design.

Commissioner Klavitter stated a straightened design would be more in keeping with the original design. He stated he preferred the handrail straight across the porch.

Motion by Klavitter, seconded by Terry, to approve the handrail and floor as is. Motion failed by the following vote: Aye – None; Nay– Klavitter, Kopczyk, Hilgendorf, Terry, McDonell, Monk, McAndrew and Rapp.

Motion by McDonell, seconded by Hilgendorf, to allow the handrail to be straightened. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, McDonell, McAndrews, Rapp, Hilgendorf, Kopczyk, Terry and Monk; Nay - None.

Design Review: Application of Full Circles Communities to install new windows on the building for property located at 180 W. 15th Street in the Jackson Park Historic District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report and proposed work. He discussed the priority levels of preserving facades as well as the significance of the building within the context of the historic district. Staff Member Johnson provided an overview of the project's conformance with applicable City Architectural Guidelines.

Commissioner Klavitter asked for a clarification on the staff report. He stated the primary facade (15th Street Side) windows will be modified in addition to the cross being removed. Staff Member Johnson confirmed window alterations are proposed on the 15th street side as well as the Main Street side of the building.

The applicants, Jordan Bartle and Lindsey Haines, Full Circle Communities, 310 South Peoria, Suite 100, Chicago, Illinois referred to a rendering and noted the location and design of the new windows on the 15th Street side. Mr. Bartle reviewed the new windows proposed on the west elevation (Main Street). He stated that there is brick on the bottom and they are proposing to move the windows all the way to the ground on the west elevation. He stated the new windows will be in keeping with the original window design and materials.

The Commission questioned whether there was a reason the cross was being removed. Mr. Bartle stated they are non-profit and do not have a religious affiliation.

Commissioner McDonell asked about the elevator. Mr. Bartle stated the elevator is on the interior and the elevator penthouse will not be visible.

Ms. Haines stated the building is being modified for persons with disabilities and veterans. Mr. Bartle stated the gym area on the west side will have a floor added, and that is why the windows are being modified.

Commissioner Klavitter asked about the windows in the upper left side of the west elevation. Mr. Bartle stated they are necessary for apartments. Commissioner Klavitter referred to the Kriviskey Study and the survey work, and that at that time it wasn't significant, but he felt it is now. Commissioner Klavitter stated that the cross helps identify the previous use of the building and has significance.

Ms. Haines stated that the unit count helps with the financial feasibility of the building. She stated that 36 units is the minimum needed which is why the new windows are needed, and if this number is reduced, it will impact the feasibility of the project.

Commissioner Terry stated that she is less concerned about the windows and more concerned about the cross being removed because it helps identify what the building was.

Ms. Haines stated the windows are deal breaker for the project, but Full Circles Communities would be agreeable to keeping the cross.

Commissioner Hilgendorf asked about the color of glass being used for the tinted panels. Mr. Bartle stated they are not set on color glass, but they would choose a color more in-keeping with the building for those panels.

Commissioner Rapp asked about removing the brick under the windows and how close the windows would be to the ground. Mr. Bartle stated that the windows will extend to the ground. Commissioner Rapp asked about landscaping of the building. Ms. Haines stated they are going to landscape the area and noted alternatives.

Motion by McDonell, seconded by Hilgendorf, to approve the application as submitted with the exception that the concrete cross built into the entrance on the north elevation must remain. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, McDonell, McAndrews, Rapp, Hilgenforf, Kopczyk, Terry and Monk; Nay - None.

Design Review: Application of Adam Johnson, Adam Johnson Architecture, to rehabilitate the building at 1065 Jackson Street in the Historic Millwork District.

Staff Member Johnson presented the staff report. He stated the structure was built in 1976. He noted the dimensions of the building and its location. He emphasized the building is not historic and the project is attempting to convert a concrete block building with little interest into a contemporary building that is compatible with the historic character of the neighborhood and area.

Adam Johnson, Adam Johnson Architecture, Galena, Illinois, stated he is available for questions. Commissioner McDonell asked about the glazing of the windows. Mr. Johnson stated they will be transparent.

Commissioner Kopczyk asked if it is going to be open under the deck, because garbage and animals could accumulate under there. Mr. Johnson stated that they have not looking into that this yet, but they could screen the bottom with a heavy mesh or wire that is framed.

Commissioner Klavitter asked about the concrete columns. Gary Carner, property owner, clarified that they will be concrete and formed and finished to look like limestone. He referred to the poured walls under the U.S. Highway 151/61 overpass as an example. Commissioner Klavitter asked about the angled stairs. Mr. Johnson stated they were for ease of pedestrian access and traffic.

Commissioner McDonell commended Mr. Johnson on the rehabbing the building to be compatible to the district, but not historic.

Motion by McDonell, seconded by Hilgendorf, to approve as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, McDonell, McAndrews, Rapp, Hilgenforf, Kopczyk, Terry and Monk; Nay - None.

Design Review: Application of Tom Kelzer to construct a four-story hotel at 1100 Jackson Street in the Historic Millwork District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He stated the Commission should get clarification on whether there are recessed entry ways into the building. He noted that the parking lot and landscaping will be addressed through the site plan review process.

Tom Kelzer, Gary Carner, and Al Urbain were present to speak to the application. Tom Kelzer, 137 Main Street, stated he represents the owners for the project. Mr. Kelzer explained Marriot Hotels have specific design standards they like in the projects. He presented an image of the original hotel concept and reviewed the efforts made to be in greater compliance with the City's Architectural Guidelines and conform better with the neighborhood.

Commissioner Hilgendorf asked about Nichiha fiber cement panels. Mr. Kelzer said it is Marriott branding material.

The Commission discussed location of the facades with respect to Jackson and 10th Streets. Commissioner Klavitter had concerns with the west elevation side on Jackson Street. He said it should have more of a pedestrian and commercial design on the first floor facing the street. Mr. Kelzer said that normally this would be the back of the hotel. He stated if there was more room, they would have designed a drop-off area along the Jackson Street side. He explained Marriot is wanting to build an extended stay hotel noting 50% of customers will stay longer than five days.

Commissioner Klavitter reiterated the façade along Jackson Street should be designed to be more pedestrian friendly and have more of a commercial look. Commissioner

McDonell discussed window configurations on the first floor. Commissioner Hilgendorf said the service doors give the appearance of the back of the building. Commissioners discussed deliveries to the building. Mr. Kelzer stated the building has service doors but no overhead service doors.

Commissioner Terry left the meeting at 6:53 p.m.

Commissioner Klavitter asked if there is an alternative material to Nichiha panels. Chairperson Monk suggested architectural metal could be used.

Commissioner Klavitter asked about the signage of the building. Commissioner McDonell said it is not a historic structure and signage should be compatible.

Commissioner Klavitter asked about trying to make the Jackson Street side more walkable and pedestrian friendly. The Commission discussed reorienting the building. The Commission and applicant discussed making two entrances on the building with a pass-through.

The Commission expressed support for the proposed materials and location of the building footprint and parking. The Commission reiterated their concern with the rear of the hotel facing the street (Jackson Street) and the lack of detail and architectural interest for the street facade. The Commission noted much of the design emphasis was focused on the side of the hotel which faces the parking lot. The Commission suggested the same design emphasis on the rear of the building be used on the Jackson Street facade and the first floor facing Jackson Street have more of a storefront appearance.

The applicants noted Marriott desires to be located in the Millwork District. The Commission noted the Millwork District is a special place and design and pedestrian continuity is a big reason for its draw. They explained the hotel needs to compliment the experience and investment in the Historic Millwork District. The Commission recommended the applicants reconsider the Jackson Street facade to serve as the "front" of the hotel and be more architecturally interesting, incorporate more of a storefront appearance, and enhance the pedestrian experience along the street front.

The applicants stated they understood the Commission's comments. The applicants requested the application be tabled to the November 17th HPC meeting to allow time for them to work with their architect on design alternatives to address the Commission's concerns. The Commission agreed to table the application to the November meeting.

Motion by McDonell, seconded by Hilgendorf, to table the application to the November 17, 2016 Commission meeting. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, McDonell, McAndrews, Rapp, Hilgenforf, Kopczyk, and Monk; Nay - None.

Items from Public

Dubuque Heritage Festival: Commissioner Klavitter updated the Commission on the Inaugural Dubuque Heritage Festival hosted by Heritage Works, Selser Schaefer Architects, and the City of Dubuque. He noted the event focused on Alfred Caldwell and the architecture in Eagle Point Park. He stated it was a great success.

Murphy Park: Commissioner Rapp provided a brief history of Murphy Park. He noted the park is lacking any interpretive signs and something interpreting its history would be beneficial. The Commission discussed the possibility of resources for a sign.

Items from Commission

Work Plan Update: Staff Member Johnson provided an update for work plan items. He explained Staff is in the process of setting up a meeting with Heritage Works and Commission champions for the Economic Impact Study and NRHP signs.

Preservation Iowa Summit: Commissioners Rapp and Monk stated they attended the Preservation Iowa Summit and it was very informative. They reviewed some of the sessions attended.

Murals: The Commission asked Staff about the new murals being painted on some buildings downtown. Staff Member Johnson noted it is art, reversible, does not require a permit and occurs on private property; therefore, the City does not review the work.

Items from Staff

Building Services Historic Preservation Enforcement Report: Staff Member Johnson provided the update for the enforcement report.

Staff Approvals: The Commission reviewed the staff approvals noting the amount of investment in historic areas.

Imagine Dubuque – Economic Prosperity Workshop: Staff Member Johnson provided an overview of Imagine Dubuque, the new City of Dubuque Comprehensive Plan. He reviewed ways the Commission can engage in the project and encouraged Commissioners to attend the October 25th Economic Prosperity workshop at the Hotel Julien.

ADJOURNMENT: Motion by McDonell, seconded by Klavitter, to adjourn the October 20, 2016 meeting. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, McDonell, McAndrews, Rapp, Hilgenforf, Kopczyk, and Monk; Nay - None.

The meeting adjourned at 7:42 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

David Johnson, Assistant Planner

Adopted