



Approved

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION
5:30 p.m.
Thursday, March 20, 2014
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Bob McDonell; Commissioners Julie Schlarman, David Klavitter, Otto Krueger, Christina Monk, Chris Olson, and Joseph Rapp.

Commissioners Excused: Commissioners Mary Loney Bichell and John Whalen.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens, David Johnson, Eric Van Buskirk, and Todd Carr

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson McDonell at 5:31 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Motion by Klavitter, second by Schlarman, to approve the minutes of the February 20, 2014 meeting as written. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – McDonell, Schlarman, Klavitter, Olson, and Rapp; Nay – none; Abstain – none.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of David Harris with Community Housing Initiatives for a Demolition Permit at 395 East 16th Street, located in the Washington Neighborhood Conservation District.

Commissioner Christina Monk arrived at 5:33 p.m.

Staff Member Johnson outlined the information in the staff report. He explained the application was tabled at the last meeting, the building was non-contributing, and clarified the role of the Commission in conservation district demolition requests. The Commission discussed whether exterior alterations could be reversed, whether the building could be made significant through rehabilitation, and whether the building was significant to the neighborhood fabric.

Commissioner Otto Krueger arrived at 5:40 p.m.

David Harris, 1600 West 32nd Street, was present to represent Community Housing Initiatives. He presented photographs of the exterior and interior of the building and

additional information about the structural condition of the building to the Commission and Staff. Mr. Harris explained the mission of Community Housing Initiatives is to rehabilitate structures but the building has significant problems, noting the constraints of the lot size, lack of central heating, and extensive long-term water damage. Harris added that the home is uninhabitable based on the condition of the interior, and that Community Housing Initiatives wants to put a single family home on the site that fits with the character of the neighborhood.

The Commission discussed the application at length, discussing the impact the demolition would have on the fabric of the neighborhood and the Washington Neighborhood National Register nomination. The Commission discussed potential changes to survey determinations due to the age of the report. The Commission noted that the decision needs to be based on the significance of the structure and not the financial-viability of the project. Staff indicated that the non-contributing status would not impact the National Register nomination.

The Commission encouraged the applicant to build a replacement that maintains the residential nature of the neighborhood, have appropriate massing, and is designed utilizing the Architectural Guidelines and relates to the architectural style of the Washington Neighborhood. Some Commissioners stressed the importance of following the survey findings for the demolition process, noting the importance of consistent criteria for evaluation and non-arbitrary decisions. Other Commissioners agreed with this but raised concerns about the accuracy of the surveys as they get older, noting that changes could be made to the structures and significant events could take place that would make the structure significant.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Schlarman, to approve the Demolition Permit for 395 East 16th Street as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Schlarman, Klavitter, Krueger, Monk, Olson and Rapp; Nay - McDonell; Abstain - none.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Joseph Kuhse for a Historic Preservation Revolving Loan to replace the roof of 1595 Fairview, located in the West 11th Street Conservation District. Staff Member Johnson presented the staff report and noted the role of the Commission in the project. Staff Member Johnson reviewed the history of the building and permits issued for the property. He noted the Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Fund Committee had reviewed and recommended funding the project.

Applicant Joseph Kuhse, 1595 Fairview, was present at the meeting and added the roof needed replacing after ice damage was caused in 2011. The Commission inquired whether further damage was caused over the past winter, which the applicant answered no. Kuhse stressed his desire to continue repairs and rehabilitation of the home now and in the future.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Klavitter, to approve the Historic Revolving Loan Fund for 1595 Fairview as presented. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – McDonell,

Schlarman, Klavitter, Krueger, Monk, Olson and Rapp; Nay - none; Abstain - none.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of The City of Dubuque for a Demolition Permit for 1401 Elm Street, located in the Washington Neighborhood Conservation District. Staff Member Johnson outlined the findings of the staff report, noting the non-contributing status of the structure, the irreversible exterior alterations supported by historic documentation, and the poor condition of the structure. Staff Member Johnson reviewed the role of the Commission in reviewing public projects.

Staff Member Todd Carr, Rehabilitation Inspector, was present to represent the Housing and Community Development Department. The Commission asked what would be done with the property after the demolition. Staff Member Carr stated that input was still being sought from the neighborhood. Staff Member Johnson added that the demolition would only impact the commercial structure on the property, and that the home on the property would remain. The Commission discussed previous demolition cases of similar types of structures, specifically noting the Jefferson Hotel, and concluded the building in this case did not have significance. The Commission also inquired why vinyl is considered a permanent alteration. Staff clarified the guidelines for establishing eligibility are determined by the National Park Service, and are used by the the consultant conducting the National Register Survey.

Motion by Klavitter, seconded by Schlarman, to approve the Demolition Permit for 1401 Elm Street. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – McDonell, Schlarman, Klavitter, Krueger, Monk, Olson and Rapp; Nay - none; Abstain - none.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: There were no items from the public.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION: Commissioner Olson inquired about the expiration of demolition permits that were reviewed by the Commission. The Commission and Staff discussed past demolition cases and noted a current demolition taking place at the corner of 14th and Washington Streets. Staff indicated that the expiration is one year, but the permit was obtained in a timely manner.

Chairperson McDonell asked for an opinion from the Legal Services Department about testimony from applicants regarding financial non-viability, when the primary review of the application is based on the architectural significance of the structure. Staff Member Carstens indicated the process would likely be similar to the Zoning Board of Adjustment where the applicant can enter the testimony but the board would not use it in making a decision. Staff indicated that they would follow up with Legal Services regarding the request.

Commissioner Olson left the meeting at 6:51 p.m.

Staff presented hard copies of the new work plan to the Commission. Commissioner Monk presented the work plan for the survey and registration goal, of which she is the champion.

Commissioner Monk noted the changes from the previous month's meeting and provided a summary of the next steps in the project, challenges, future funding, and possible solutions. She asked staff to provide a map of each of the areas that need to be surveyed to provide clarification.

Commissioner McDonell asked staff to include monthly updates on the work plan to the agenda. Commissioner Monk added that she would like the work plan to be included in the packet sent to Commissioners each month.

Commissioner Schlarman presented the work plan for the Preservation of Public Open Spaces, provided an overview of her meeting with Planning Staff, and discussed the definition of the goal, work plan challenges, and potential solutions.

ITEMS FROM STAFF: Staff presented the media release for the Architecture Days event. Staff Member Johnson asked the Commission who would be attending the Ken Kringle Award Presentations so that he could provide a head count of attendees to the organizers of the event. Commissioners McDonell, Schlarman, Klavitter, Krueger, and Monk indicated that they would be in attendance. Staff provided the Commission with an example of the Ken Kringle Award design, and Commissioner McDonell asked if a meeting could be scheduled with staff to discuss the award presentations.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 6:57 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Laura Carstens, Planning Services Manager

Adopted