



Approved

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, January 19, 2012

City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Commissioners Chris Olson, John Whalen, Mary Loney Bichell, Joseph Rapp, Chris Wand and Mitzi Krey.

Commissioners Excused: Chairperson David Klavitter and Commissioner Bob McDonell.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens, David Johnson and Aaron DeJong.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Acting Chairperson Chris Olson at 5:34 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Motion by Rapp, seconded by Whalen, to table approval of the November 17, 2011 meeting minutes as they were copied in error. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Loney-Bichell, Rapp, and Krey; Nay – None.

PUBLIC HEARING/NATIONAL REGISTER HISTORIC DISTRICT: Application of the City of Dubuque for an amendment and update to the Cathedral Historic District.

Acting Chairperson Olson opened the public hearing. Staff Member Johnson reviewed the rationale for updating and amending the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) nomination for the Cathedral Historic District. He explained the period of significance in the original nomination incorrectly ended at the year 1900 and it becoming an obstacle for property owners with historically significant buildings placed in service after that date to qualify for State and Federal financial incentives to rehabilitate their properties. He stated previous amendments were done by submitting a letter; however, the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) will not amend the district any further without a comprehensive update and amendment to the nomination.

Staff Member Johnson explained the proposed amendment is much more comprehensive than the original nomination. He stated the amendment identifies 14 additional buildings which contribute to the Cathedral NRHP district and more appropriately highlights the contributions institutional buildings played in the district and city. He noted the 14 buildings, as well as Washington Park and the St. Mary's Street retaining wall, will be eligible for State and Federal incentives.

Staff Member Johnson stated the State Nominations Review Committee will consider the Cathedral Historic District Update and Amendment for nomination to the NRHP during their February 10, 2012 meeting. He noted that as a participant in the Certified Local Government Program, the City of Dubuque is required to review and comment on proposed NRHP nominations of properties within its jurisdiction. He explained SHPO is requesting the Commission review the nomination, and then comment on whether the Cathedral Historic District Update and Amendment meets significance criteria A, B, C or D for listing in the NRHP. He stated the district is locally significant under criterion C, which is properties that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.

There were no public comments.

Commissioners discussed the nomination, and agreed it met significance criterion C for listing in the NRHP. The Commission commended staff's effort to put together the extensive update.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Bichell, to recommend approval of the Cathedral Historic District NRHP nomination as it meets Criterion C for listing. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Loney-Bichell, Rapp, and Krey; Nay – None.

DEMOLITION PERMIT/APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS:

Application of Dubuque County / William Feye for a demolition permit to demolish the building at 653 White Street located in the Downtown Neighborhood Conservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He explained there are two structures located on the parcel addressed at 653 White Street. He referenced a map depicting the two buildings. He stated building number one is vacant and described as an early 20th Century industrial building. He stated the building is a remnant of the former Jefferson Hotel built in 1856. He explained the original hotel had four stories and was an Italianate design. He explained the building survived a fire in 1908 and continued operation as a hotel until it was purchased in 1921 by the Sanitary Milk Company. He stated the Sanitary Milk Company substantially rebuilt the facility. He clarified the one-story brick addition to the remnant Jefferson Hotel with the smokestack was constructed between 1909 and 1946, with a likely construction date between 1921 and 1936 during the time that the Sanitary Milk Company made their changes to the facility. He stated by 1964 the complex had been reduced to the present two surviving two-story corner buildings. He referenced Sanborn Maps and stated they show the top two stories of the Jefferson Hotel were lost between 1946 and 1964.

He stated building number two is located in the same place as the former Jefferson Hotel barn and horse stable. The horse stable was constructed in 1873 and was demolished between 1909 and 1946 when the current tile building first appeared. He

explained what was left of the horse stable was most likely removed between 1921 and 1936 as part of the Sanitary Milk Company's changes to the site. He stated the building is currently used as an automotive repair shop.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the role of the Commission in reviewing demolition permits in Conservation Districts. He explained the Commission needs to determine whether the buildings have historic or architectural significance to the community or whether denial of the proposed demolition permit would prevent the property owner from earning a reasonable economic return on the property. He clarified, at this time, the Commission only needs to determine whether the building has historical or architectural significance to the community. He explained if the Commission finds the buildings do not have historical or architectural significance to the community, the Commission should approve the demolition permit.

Staff Member Johnson explained the property was part of the *Phase III Architectural and Historical Survey Report*. He referenced the Master List of Surveyed Phase III Downtown Properties and noted the buildings were not found to have historical significance when surveyed. He noted the report further indicates the buildings are not eligible for individual listing on the NRHP and would not contribute to a NRHP district.

He explained although the property was not found historically or architecturally significant in the Master List of Surveyed Phase III Downtown Properties, an Iowa Site Inventory form was still prepared because of the interesting history of the former hotel. Staff Member Johnson explained the Commission must consider whether what's left of the former Jefferson Hotel is substantial enough to determine the building has more than local historical interest and has historic significance to the community and is worthy of preservation in its current form.

Mary Ann Specht, representing the Dubuque County Board of Supervisors, explained this is a joint application of the County and property owner William Feye. She noted Mr. Feye has made an offer to sell the building to the County. She explained the Board feels the site would be advantageous for the County's need for additional office space due to its proximity to the Court House. She noted that based on the County's review of the materials and the staff report, they conclude the building is not significant. She noted the County does not feel rehabilitation of the building is economically feasible or could fit the County's needs. She explained that the County is evaluating this site for a new County office building.

She explained there are a number of County offices that are currently leasing space, and the County has an office space needs assessment underway. She noted that when this study is complete, the County will make a final development decision.

Commissioner Bichell felt the building's history as a hotel at this site and the existing remnant are deserving of preservation and re-use as office space. Commissioner Olson reviewed the criteria for determining significance and noted that unfortunately due to the extent of losses to the building, it would not be eligible for listing on the NRHP and

was not evaluated as having historical significance. Commissioner Whalen agreed the former Jefferson Hotel is not historically significant because it is only half of what once existed. The Commission noted the remnant building no longer has architectural significance.

Staff Member Carstens clarified the process for evaluating properties and reviewed the criteria for establishing whether a property has historical significance. The Commission noted other studies where properties may have had historical interest, but could no longer rise to the level of being historically significant.

Ms. Specht stated the County is currently leasing office space at various locations and at a substantial expense, and they would like to consolidate into a downtown location. She explained that the County has looked at potentially rehabilitating existing buildings. She further explained that the best option appears to be a new structure that meets current code and ADA requirements to consolidate services downtown. She explained the office study is in the first of four phases, and should be completed in approximately six months. She reiterated the benefits of being close to the proximity courthouse and law enforcement center, and the need to consolidate services provided by the County.

NOTE: Commissioner Wand arrived at 6:10 p.m.

Ms. Specht explained the County is also looking at consolidation of related services by other agencies as well as other government offices.

Commissioners discussed saving or re-using the remnant of the hotel as part of any re-use, perhaps as part of the façade.

Ms. Specht reviewed the County would prefer to build a new, modern building because the cost of rehabilitation is not economically feasible and the building in its current form would not meet their needs. Staff Member Johnson noted the site is in the Downtown Design Guidelines area, and any new construction utilizing a source of public funds would be subject to Historic Preservation Commission design review.

Commissioners discussed the proposal, and clarified they are making a decision on the demolition permit. Staff Member Carstens explained because the County is a political subdivision of the State, the request for a demolition permit will also be reviewed by the City Council should the Commission deny the permit.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Wand, to approve the demolition permit as presented, noting the buildings are not historically significant. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Bichell, and Wand; Nay – Rapp and Krey; Abstain – None.

ADVISORY DESIGN REVIEW/HISTORIC MILLWORK DISTRICT: Application of City of Dubuque for an Advisory Design Review for and Intermodal Campus located at E. 9th, 10th & 11th Streets, between Washington Street and U.S. Highway 61/151 Freeway in the Historic Millwork District.

Staff Member Johnson provided an overview of the project and its relationship to the Downtown Design Guidelines and the Historic Millwork District. He explained the Historic Preservation Commission is being asked to provide feedback to the design team, and the Commission will see the design again as an advisor to the City Council. He noted the State Historic Preservation Office has reviewed the proposal and they are in support of the concept.

Assistant Economic Development Director Aaron DeJong explained the Intermodal Campus and the three principal uses of the terminal building, the passenger rail platform, and a parking ramp. He explained the proposal and future phases for a second story of the terminal facility building, additional floors on the ramp, and a Jule Transit bus facility. He introduced the design team from Neumann Monson, consultants.

Khalid Khan, Neumann-Monson, reviewed the project and design approach. He explained the parking ramp is located close to the Caradaco building and 9th Street, with a connection to the terminal building, train platform, and future location of the Jule Transit's bus facility. He reviewed the landscape plantings and bioswales on the site plan. He then reviewed the elevations for the parking ramp. He explained the north elevation shows the 9th Street façade is intended to create a visual boundary, and then the other facades open up to the interior of the Historic Millwork District and Foundry Square, showing phases 1 & 2. He reviewed the south elevation for phase 1 and 2. He then reviewed the east facades for phases 1 & 2. Mr. Khan said concrete piers and base, terra cotta panels and glass stairwells are the principal materials. He reviewed the elevations for the terminal building's phase 1 and 2 on the east and west elevations. He noted the use of terra cotta.

He next reviewed aerial views, noting the more open facades to the open space in the plaza area. He explained the massing, scale and rhythm of the parking structure in relation to the Historic Millwork District. He noted the base draws from the loading docks of the warehouses in the Historic Millwork District. He explained the design of the vertical circulation and pedestrian connections, and how the design draws from the rhythm of the brick work of the Historic Millwork District. He noted the use of terra cotta and how the construction allows the ramp to remain open and breathe while also connecting to the terminal building, shielding headlights and other vehicles. He reviewed the design elements and textural effects of the ramp project. He showed a picture of the Garland Street Ramp at the University of Arkansas and noted the proposed ramp for the Intermodal Campus will be similar in effect.

Commissioners discussed the project, including durability of the proposed materials and how the terra cotta pieces are installed. Commissioners discussed how the design might be more consistent to mimic brick more, with some random areas to create a rhythm of voids and horizontal lines.

Mr. Khan explained design elements of the Garland Street ramp, and the different facades based on south or north exposures.

Commissioners discussed the design guidelines and appreciated a design approach which did not attempt to make the ramp look like a building or historic. Commissioners asked if there will be multiple uses in the ramp. Staff Member DeJong explained 9th Street has never been a pedestrian route, and has no destinations. The Commission discussed introducing a retail component or design on the ground floor to enhance the pedestrian continuity and interaction. Staff Member DeJong explained with over one million square feet of vacant space in the Historic Millwork District, the City did not feel the ramp should compete with the marketing efforts for historic buildings in the Historic Millwork District.

Commissioners discussed surface parking lot proposed in place of the planned plaza. Staff Member DeJong reviewed the parking lot on Foundry Square is intended to be a temporary parking lot until the ramp is built. Commissioners emphasized the surface lot needs to be temporary as Foundry Square is an important design and pedestrian component of the Historic Millwork District. Staff Member DeJong agreed, noting the Plaza is needed for the Historic Millwork District, and this remains the ultimate goal.

Commissioners asked about the screening along Washington Street. Staff Member DeJong and Khalid Khan noted the wall will screen electrical transformers along the sidewalk. Mr. Khan noted SHPO requested the design consider bringing the stair tower to the front property line along Washington Street.

Commissioners discussed the platform. Staff Member DeJong and Mr. Khan confirmed it will be a canopy roof only, not enclosed, in order to meet Amtrak standards, and there will be no enclosure except in the terminal building. They discussed that the terminal building will be open to the public and have 1,000 square feet waiting area on two stories.

Commissioners asked about bike parking. Mr. Khan stated there will be bike lockers, parking and storage incorporated into the ramp. Staff Member DeJong reviewed the bike route will be on 10th & Jackson, and extend from 7th Street to the Port. Mr. Khan clarified a green roof is proposed for the terminal building roofs.

Commissioners expressed their appreciation for an early review, and reiterated more consistent terra cotta on ramp facades as previously discussed, and suggested a more solid façade on the terminal building facing the railroad tracks and freeway.

EDUCATION TASK FORCE:

Update on Public Outreach and Education Program: Commissioner Krey stated she is researching grants for producing a video and documenting the “hidden history” of buildings in Dubuque. It was noted Chairperson Klavitter will be presenting to the Old House Enthusiasts.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: Steve Ulstad, 2320 Buckskin Circle, presented information about a stone spring house along Carter Road, near Arabian Trail. Staff distributed photos, an MLS listing and maps of the site for sale. He expressed his concern over the

future of this historic structure. He explained the structure protects a natural spring, which daylight below the opening of the structure.

Commissioners discussed moving the structure, or other options for retaining the structure in place. Discussion followed as to the ownership of the parcel, which may be City property. Staff will research ownership, and then bring this item back to the Commission in the future.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION: The Commission discussed the house located at 346-348 W. Locust that was recently donated to the City of Dubuque. The Commission noted is a significant start to needed investment in the neighborhood. The Commission stated there are a couple broken windows that need to be repaired.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Carnegie Stout Public Library Signs: Staff Member Johnson noted that Chairperson Klavitter had emailed the Commission about the results of the City Council meeting. He noted the City Council was very appreciative and complimentary of the Commission. He noted the Council asked the Commission and Library Board to meet and try to reach a consensus on the design of the Library signs. He said special meetings of the Historic Preservation Commission and Library Board of Trustees have been scheduled for February 9 at 5:30 p.m. at the Library Auditorium, and a quorum is needed.

Commissioners discussed the signs and the design guidelines. Staff Member Johnson noted the two major issues were height of the sign and the design and material of the columns. He said Dan Lange, Lange Signs, will be at the special joint meeting. He noted Mr. Lange apologized at the City Council meeting for the signs being installed without an approved permit. He explained that the Historic Preservation Commission and Library Board of Trustees must each have a quorum and minutes, but will still meet jointly.

Website: Staff Member Johnson noted additional useful links have been added to the Historic Preservation page of the City of Dubuque website which address sustainability and preservation, weatherization, and the benefits of preserving and restoring wood windows.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 7:33 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Laura Carstens, Planning Services Manager

Adopted—March 15, 2012