

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION
5:30 p.m.
Thursday, November 17, 2011
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Chairperson David Klavitter; Commissioners Chris Olson, John Whalen, Mary Loney Bichell, Chris Wand and Mitzi Krey.

Commissioners Excused: Commissioners Joseph Rapp and Bob McDonell.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens and David Johnson.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Klavitter at 5:33 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Motion by Wand, seconded by Whalen, to approve the minutes of the September 15, 2011 meeting as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell, Wand and Krey; Nay - None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Judy Davison for a Certificate of Appropriateness to rehabilitate the building located at 1132-1134 Locust Street in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report and discussed the proposed improvements to the two townhouses. He reviewed the Commission's past discussion and the Certificate of Appropriateness that was previously approved January 20, 2011. He summarized the scope of work and noted the project is a historic tax credit project. Staff directed the Commission to photos and drawings that have been included with the application.

Adam Johnson, 211 4th Street, Galena, Illinois, introduced himself as the project architect and reviewed several items in addition to the staff report. He noted two small additions on the rear of each building, and explained both are proposed to be resided with cement board siding pending tax credit review. He also noted that the chimney on the addition to 1134 Locust Street has been removed due to its poor condition and questioned whether the Commission would like the chimney rebuilt in the springtime.

The Commission discussed the chimney, rear additions and proposed prefab columns on the historic porch. The Commission also discussed the Certificate of Appropriateness that was issued in January of 2011. Adam Johnson reported minor demolition work had been accomplished prior to his involvement in the project, but most of the time spent after the original Certificate of Appropriateness was issued was organizing the project and lining up general contractors.

Staff Member Johnson noted the scope of work under this Certificate of Appropriateness application is much greater than the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness. He noted the proposal to open up the porch that was enclosed in 1939 is a substantial difference from the former application. He noted that although the project is a historic tax credit project, it is also located in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District and therefore requires review by the Historic Preservation Commission and the State Historic Preservation Office.

The Commission further discussed the prefabricated columns and chimneys. The consensus of the Commission was that the chimney on the small single-story addition that was removed does not need to be rebuilt. The Commission discussed the prefabricated columns and noted previous approvals of synthetic materials have required a brushed paint finish.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Bichell, to approve the request as submitted, noting the prefabricated columns need to be painted with a brush finish and the chimney on the small single-story addition does not have to be rebuilt. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell, Wand and Krey; Nay - None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Jason Conrad for a Certificate of Appropriateness to build a two-car garage located at 1020 W. 3rd Street in the Langworthy Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He explained the previous owner received a Special Exception to build a 24' x 24' detached garage 3 feet from the east property line in 2004 contingent on the future garage being reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. He noted a permit to install the foundation, which has been utilized as a parking pad, was issued on April 28, 2004. He reviewed the proposed garage design, materials and location.

Jason Conrad, 1020 W. 3rd Street, distributed a garage door brochure. He explained that the 6 ¼" exposure for the proposed siding is the closest match to the 7 ¼" exposure on the home's asbestos siding. He clarified the siding has a slight texture to it similar to the house.

The Commission discussed the proposed siding, fascia, soffit, and other materials. Mr. Conrad confirmed that he has no plans to remove the asbestos siding on the home.

Commissioners noted the texture proposed for the garage siding will be similar to the asbestos siding on the house, and that the garage is new construction, not a restoration or re-creation. Commissioners clarified that the garage will have a 12” eave although it is not shown on the sketches. The Commission discussed the fascia materials. The Commission noted the requested aluminum soffit and fascia is not consistent with previous Certificates of Appropriateness for new garages. The consensus of the Commission was to require the same materials for the fascia and soffit as is being used as the siding. The Commission discussed the need to vent the soffit.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Whalen, to approve the application as submitted with the following conditions:

1. Ensure there is a 12” eave for the overhang;
2. Use the garage door as depicted in the design submitted by the applicant at the meeting; and
3. Use the same structural material for the fascia and soffits that is being used for the siding.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell, Wand and Krey; Nay - None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Kurt & Crystal Rojemann to Amend the Certificate of Appropriateness to roof the property located at 630 W. 11th Street in the W. 11th Street Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, noting the Certificate of Appropriateness approved at the June 2011 meeting required the clay tile on the roof ridges be retained as character-defining features. He explained the applicant is requesting an amendment to the Certificate of Appropriateness because the clay tiles could not be retained as part of the roof project.

Kurt and Crystal Rojemann, 630 W. 11th Street, were present. Mr. Rojemann distributed a letter from the roofing company, Hahn Roofing, regarding the condition of the clay tile. He noted they approached the project with every intention to retain the clay tile features and even built that requirement into the contract with the roofing company. He explained that the roofing crew determined the clay tiles as well as other features were not salvageable due to their poor condition and interlocking problems.

Commissioner Olson stated that she had a conversation with a member of Hahn Roofing about the roofing project before work on the roof began. She explained the roofing representative noted that they would not be retaining the clay tile features because they had to answer to the insurance company and not the Historic

Preservation Commission. Mr. Rojemann noted that he had a different conversation with the roofer, and both the roofing crew as well as company executives explained to him that the clay tile features could not be salvaged because of their condition. The Commission noted that unfortunately there are oftentimes disconnects between company executives, roofers and the needs of their clients.

Mr. Rojemann reiterated the contract was written as per the requirements of the Certificate of Appropriateness. He stated he felt he ended up with a nice roof but was also disappointed that the roofing company was not able to salvage the clay tile and other roofing features. Mr. and Mrs. Rojemann discussed that the diamond features were not saved as contracted, but they have unfortunately already paid the contract in full. The Rojemann's stated they were very disappointed to learn once the project was finished that the architectural features were not saved anywhere, nor were they going to be replaced. The Commission noted that the roofing company did not fulfill their obligations of the contract and therefore they should demand compensation for work they were paid to do but did not fulfill. The Commission noted any rebate could be used to hire a more responsible company that can reintroduce those features. The Commission noted the valleys did turn out very nice and the rest of the roof looks nice. The Commission discussed options for getting the diamond-shaped features replicated or perhaps found in salvage warehouse.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Bichell, to amend the Certificate of Appropriateness as presented due to the clay tile ridge caps being in poor condition and not able to be re-used. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye –Olson, Whalen, Wand and Krey; Nay – Klavitter and Bichell.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Michael Knight/ Robert Johnson, Mid America Holdings for a Application for Certificate of Appropriateness to rehabilitate the building located at 1079 Elm Street in the Historic Millwork District.

Staff Member Johnson explained the applicant submitted a letter to the Planning Services Department requesting that the application be tabled to the December 15, 2011 meeting in order to provide time for the applicant to finalize a few remaining issues with the National Park Service with regard to the tax credit application. The Commission noted the tabled application needs to provide more information about the windows. The Commission in particular questioned the proposed T-shaped windows as well as information on what will be done with the existing inappropriate windows.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Olson, to table the application as requested by the applicant. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell, Wand and Krey; Nay - None.

PUBLIC HEARING: Application of The City of Dubuque for a Landmark Nomination for the White Water Creek Bridge located at 7600 Chavenelle Drive (Lot H Dubuque Industrial Center West Final Plat).

Motion by Wand, seconded by Bichell, to open the public meeting. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell, Wand and Krey; Nay - None.

There were no public comments.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Klavitter to close the meeting to public comment. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell, Wand and Krey; Nay - None.

The Commission discussed the application to designate the Historic White Water Creek Bridge as a local landmark. Staff Member Johnson reviewed the historical significance of the bridge as well as the background on previous locations. He explained that the bridge was previously listed on the National Register; however, when the bridge was first relocated it was removed from the National Register because it lost its historical context. He noted the State Historic Preservation Office is requiring a new nomination be prepared as part of grant funding for the bridge rehabilitation. He explained initial conversations with SHPO have indicated that the building will again be eligible. The Commission discussed the historic significance of the bridge, noting the bridge would most likely be eligible under Criteria A and B when a nomination is prepared to list the bridge on the National Register of Historic Places.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Bichell, to recommend to City Council that the White What Creek Bridge be designated as a local landmark, as it meets the criteria for consideration, and support the National Register of Historic Places nomination as it would be eligible under National Register of Historic Places Significance Criteria A and B. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell, Wand and Krey; Nay - None.

EDUCATION TASK FORCE

Update on Public Outreach and Education Program: Chairperson Klavitter updated the Commission on the progress of initiatives undertaken by the Education Task Force. The Commission referenced the minutes and Commissioner Olson clarified that the Four Mounds Foundation received a grant from the Community Foundation of Greater Dubuque, not the Greater Dubuque Development Corporation. She suggested that the Task Force look into the Neighborhood Development Grant Program of the Community Foundation. She suggested checking in June for grant opportunities and information.

Chairperson Klavitter noted he has met with the Tax Credit Coordinator for the Historic

Millwork District at Dubuque Main Street. He noted the Task Force has also looked into contacting Bob Yapp to conduct a window restoration program in the city of Dubuque.

Chairperson Klavitter brought to the Commission's attention a Historic Properties page on Facebook as well as the potential for Commissioners to reach out to the Old Home Enthusiasts for partnership opportunities.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: None.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION:

Carnegie Stout Public Library Signs: Staff Member Carstens reviewed the background of the Carnegie Stout Public Library (CSPL) signs. The Commission reviewed that they were informed of an alternative design that was being prepared by Lange Sign for the CSPL freestanding signs. Based on that information, the Historic Preservation Commission reconsidered their previous motion, which reflected their concerns regarding the signs design and process. Their initial motion was to approve the design of the signs as submitted without the columns and use a stone or concrete base raised no more than 12" above the ground, and change the color of the painted parts of the sign to match the color of the building. Staff explained that the only change to the signs was that the sign contractor agreed to repaint the painted portions of the sign to a color recommended by the Commission, but no significant changes were proposed for the sign design.

Staff Member Carstens noted the position of the Carnegie Stout Public Library Board is that they are willing to repaint the signs with a color that blends better with the building, but they are not willing to remove the columns because the Board would like to maintain the functional height of the signs.

The Commission discussed the position of the Library Board. The Commission reiterated their position that the sign design is inappropriate, noting that the columns are inappropriate, too tall, and the sign does not need to be the height that it is. The Commission explained the CSPL is an iconic building in the city of Dubuque and the building itself serves as the sign. The Commission noted people know where the building is located and due to the proximity of the signs to Bluff Street and Locust Streets, the signs are not effective to passing traffic regardless.

The Commission questioned why the Library Board is unwilling to compromise on the Commission's concerns with features of the signs. The Commission reiterated their position that it is not the fault of the Library Board that the appropriate process was not followed and the necessary permits were not obtained to install the signs. The Commission explained that is the responsibility of the professional sign contractor hired by the Library and therefore the Library should require the sign contractor to make the requested changes at the contractor's expense.

The Commission noted the City of Dubuque and Historic Preservation Commission

expects residents and businesses in Historic Districts to follow the proper process and obtain permits prior to work beginning, and questioned why a Library project would not have the same expectations. Staff Member Carstens noted that to date, a sign permit still has not been issued for the CSPL signs. She explained she is not fully aware of the reasons behind the Library Board's decisions; however, from meeting with the Library Board once, the Board feels the signs are installed and effective, and they do not want to invest any more money in modifying the signs. The Commission reiterated the Library Board should require the sign contractor to make and pay for the changes.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Whalen, to re-affirm their initial motion to recommend approval of the signs without the columns and instead use a stone or concrete base raised no more than 12" above the ground, and to change the color of the painted parts of the sign to match the color of the building for the all reasons discussed at the February 17, 2011 and August 18, 2011 Historic Preservation Commission meetings. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell, Wand and Krey; Nay - None.

"Miller v. City of Annapolis Preservation Commission": Staff Member Johnson noted that Chairperson Klavitter requested the item be placed on the Historic Preservation Commission agenda. Commissioner Wand explained he requested the item be placed on the agenda for informational purposes.

The Commission reviewed the legal case, noting the Maryland Court of Special Appeals upheld the City of Annapolis Historic Preservation Commission's requirement that a homeowner use wood building materials rather than artificial materials. Staff Member Johnson noted the binding precedent was set only in Maryland. He did note, however, that the same ability is granted to the City of Dubuque Historic Preservation Commission by the Historic Preservation Ordinance, architectural guidelines, and Secretary of Interior's Standards.

Election: Vice Chairperson: Staff Member Johnson noted that Vice-Chairperson Knight has officially resigned and a replacement vice-chairperson needs to be elected. He clarified the elected vice-chairperson will serve out the unexpired term until the July 2012 meeting at which time the elected officer can serve in the same capacity for a second consecutive year if re-elected.

The Commission discussed candidates, noting Commissioner McDonell's past interest in holding an office position on the Commission. The Commission explained Commissioner McDonell would do an excellent job as vice-chairperson and as a representative of the Historic Preservation Commission. The Commission recognized Commissioner McDonell's recent efforts in historic preservation education and outreach and felt he would make an excellent vice-chairperson.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Bichell, to nominate Commissioner McDonell as Vice-

Chairperson of the Historic Preservation Commission. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell, Wand and Krey; Nay - None.

The Commission discussed recruiting for the vacant at-large position. Staff Member Johnson suggested the Commission consider encouraging Commissioner Rapp to apply for the at-large position. Staff Member Johnson explained Commissioner Rapp is currently an interim representative of the Old Main Historic Preservation District. He explained should a resident of that district apply, Commissioner Rapp would be removed from the Commission. He explained Commissioner Rapp has done an excellent job on the Commission, and he would make a good candidate. The Commission noted Commissioner Rapp's depth of knowledge when it comes to Dubuque history.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Building Services Historic Preservation Enforcement Report Update: Staff Member Johnson noted that the updates are depicted in bold. He stated the porch project at 1439 Bluff Street has been completed and approved, and has therefore been removed from the enforcement report.

The Commission discussed some of the recent welcomed improvements within the historic districts. The Commission discussed the progress at 995 Grove Terrace.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 7:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Laura Carstens, Planning Services Manager

Adopted—March 15, 2012