



Approved

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION
5:30 p.m.
Thursday, September 15, 2011
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Commissioners Chris Olson, John Whalen, Joseph Rapp, Chris Wand and Bob McDonnell.

Commissioners Excused: Chairperson David Klavitter; Commissioners Michael Knight, Mary Loney-Bichell and Mitzi Krey.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens and David Johnson

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Wand at 5:30 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Motion by McDonnell, seconded by Olson, to approve the minutes of the August 18, 2011 meeting, as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Rapp, Wand and McDonnell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of J. Allen & Audrey Wallis for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the rear porch and steps for the property located at 940 Bluff Street in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson noted the applicant was not able to attend the meeting and has requested that the Historic Preservation Commission proceed with the Design Review.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report noting the drawings provided for the Commission that were prepared by Main Street Iowa. He explained the applicant wishes to reconstruct the second story porch on the back of the building and stairs leading down the side of the building. He explained that a porch had previously existed on the back of the building as evidenced by the ghost lines and scarring on the brick.

Staff Member Johnson explained the porch will be constructed of wood and the railing designs for the porch and stair will be an extension of the existing stairway on the first floor on the rear of the building. Staff Member Johnson explained that the second story porch will have a hip roof identical to the design of the previous roof. He noted the roofing material will be rubber.

The Commission discussed the request. They noted the vertical dividers between the box beam and the handrail of the porch noting that screening will most likely be located in that area.

The Commission noted that the applicant has the option of installing screening or not and noted the drawings must indicate a preference to do so since the vertical screening elements would be otherwise unnecessary and an additional cost to the project.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Wand, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted, with the condition that the porch be painted or opaque stained. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Rapp, Wand and McDonnell; Nay – None.

ADVISORY DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Jon Luckstead / Unitarian Universalist Fellowship of Dubuque for an Advisory Design Review to replace limestone curb with concrete steps for property located at 1699 Iowa Street in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Carstens reviewed the staff report. She noted the application explains the existing limestone and curb is in disrepair and needs to be replaced. She explained the applicant is requesting to replace the limestone curbing with a concrete step alternative and handrail that will repair the curbing but also allow safe access between W. 17th Street and the church. She explained the railing will match the railing approved by the Commission in 2008.

Staff Member Carstens reviewed that the role of the Historic Preservation Commission in reviewing public works projects, is to serve as an advisory design review body to the City Council.

Jon Luckstead, representative for the Unitarian Universalist Fellowship of Dubuque, noted the curb height is 15 ½ inches high and since it requires repair, the steps would be safer and allow great accessibility.

The Commission discussed the project. They encouraged the applicant to check with the Building Services Department and the ADA Inspector for possible restrictions for the proposed railing extensions due to the street and sidewalk locations.

The Commission discussed the concrete step alternative and railing. They noted that the concrete steps and railing was a functional change and is an acceptable alternative and a reasonable request.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Whalen, to recommend that the City Council approve the request as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Rapp, Wand and McDonnell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Charles & Susan Huntley / The Hancock House for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the roof for property located at 1105 Grove Terrace in the W. 11th Street Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the application. He noted the applicant approached the

Commission at the July meeting to discuss the potential to replace the damaged asbestos slate roof with an asphalt alternative. He noted the consensus of the Commission, at that time, was that an asphalt alternative would be acceptable provided copper elements were retained and a more appropriate asphalt design were chosen.

Staff Member Johnson noted the applicants are requesting a Grand Manor style asphalt shingle which resembles a slate appearance. He stated the cooper flashings, valleys and ornamental features will be retained.

Chuck Huntley, 1105 Grove Terrace, was present and introduced the contractor, Craig Wall of Premier Exterior Solutions. Mr. Wall reviewed the previous discussion of the slate and copper replacement materials. He distributed the material samples for the Grand Manor asphalt shingle and explained how they are installed and how they perform over time. He explained the color that will be installed is black and reiterated the CertanTeed Grand Manor asphalt shingle is meant to be representative of a natural slate.

The Commission discussed the proposal and questioned the treatment of the ridges and dormers. Mr. Wall provided a Centennial Slate sample board which illustrated how a ridge vent can be used to mimic ridge and dormer features on the existing roof.

The Commission discussed maintaining the current look as closely as possible using the proposed shingle. The Commission discussed the use of copper.

Mr. Wall explained that the copper flashing and other copper features not hit by hail will be reused and not replaced. Mr. Wall explained the property owner would like to use a Modified Bitumen roofing material for the flat roof portion of the roof. He noted copper flashing will be wrapped over the edges of the flat portion, so all that could be seen from the public way is the copper edges.

Motion by McDonnell, seconded by Whalen, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Rapp, Wand and McDonnell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Christina Canganelli / David Canganelli Trust for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the roof for property located at 560 W. 11th Street in the W. 11th Street Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He explained the request is similar to the request at 1105 Grove Terrace. He noted the existing roofing material is an asbestos slate material that was also damaged by hail and needs to be replaced. He noted the asbestos slate is a material that is no longer used and the applicant is requesting to use a CertanTeed Grand Manor asphalt shingle as an alternative to the asbestos slate.

Craig Wall, Premier Exterior Solutions, presented the request. He noted that he is representing the Canganelli Trust and Dubuque Bank & Trust. He noted the request is to use

a black Grand Manor style asphalt shingle and copper flashing to replace the roof at 560 W. 11th Street. He noted copper flashings and valleys will be retained similar to the project at 1105 Grove Terrace. He proposed a Modified Bitumen material for the flat roof portion of 560 W. 11th Street. He explained how the modern roof would be treated and perform. He reiterated that he planned to reuse the copper flashing and features, as previously discussed.

Motion by Olson, seconded by McDonnell, to approve the request as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Rapp, Wand and McDonnell; Nay – None.

EDUCATION TASK FORCE

Update on Public Outreach and Education Program

Commissioner McDonnell updated the Commission on the progress of the programming. He explained that the task force met with Cable TV and Planning staff to discuss the Historic Preservation program series. He stated that the Cable TV Division is extremely overwhelmed at this time and would not be able to develop the series of programming as desired by the task force.

Commissioner McDonnell explained that the task force has approached Loras College on their interest on developing a historic preservation program series. The Commission discussed opportunities, such as Dubuque365, to assist with the program. Commissioner McDonnell noted Chairperson Klavitter will be approaching the Ad Federation of Dubuque about their potential involvement. Commissioner McDonnell noted that the task force will keep the Commission informed on their progress in developing a program series consistent with the vision of the task force.

The Commission thanked Commissioner McDonnell and the task force for their work in developing the program and historic preservation education.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: None.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION:

Carnegie Stout Public Library Signs – Reconsideration of Motion

Staff Member Carstens reviewed the history of the Carnegie Stout Public Library Signs. She explained that at the August Commission meeting, the Commission reaffirmed its recommendation to City Council to approve the sign design without the columns and to change the color of the sign to a more appropriate color for the building. She explained the Commission's position was again forwarded to Carnegie Stout Public Library Director, Susan Henricks, who in turn, forwarded it to Lange Sign. Ms. Henricks informed Planning Services staff that Lange Sign has a new sign design for the Carnegie Stout Public Library Board to review. Staff Member Carstens noted that she consulted with Chairperson Klavitter who has requested the Historic Preservation Commission reconsider the motion on the Library signs and redirect that motion to the Library Board for their consideration at their September 29, 2011 meeting.

Commissioner Rapp left the meeting at 6:05 p.m.

Motion by Wand, seconded by McDonnell, to bring the motion back to the table for discussion. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Wand and McDonnell; Nay – None; Abstain - Rapp.

The Commission discussed the appropriate procedures for directing a motion to the Library Board. The Commission noted that this is positive development.

Commissioner Rapp reentered the meeting at 6:09 p.m.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Whalen, to forward the Commission's recommendation to the Library Board with the following suggestions: 1) To maintain the sign design without the columns, 2) to use a stone or concrete base no more than 12 inches above the ground; 3) to change the color of the painted parts of the sign to match the color of the building; and 4) to thank the Library Board for its reconsideration. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Rapp, Wand and McDonnell; Nay – None.

W. Locust Street & Bluff Street Neighborhood Area – Council Priorities

Staff Member Carstens noted a letter was forwarded to City Council requesting the Council place the W. Locust & Bluff Street Neighborhood Area on the goal setting agenda and make it a top priority for the goal setting session. She noted the W. Locust & Bluff Street Neighborhood Area did not make the list of Council priorities for the 2011-2013 Policy Agenda. She explained it was not because the Council did not feel it was not an important issue, rather the Council's focus this year was on following through with existing community goals and priorities. She explained the City Manager suggested the Commission can continue to provide information on this area to the City Council.

The Commission discussed projects that did make the list. Staff Member Carstens agreed to provide a more extensive list of this year's Council priorities. The Commission agreed that they will keep the issue on the forefront.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Building Services Historic Preservation Enforcement Report Update

Staff Member Johnson noted updates are depicted in bold type and welcomed questioned or comments. The Commission noted that some cases appear to be stagnant, but others are moving along. Staff Member Johnson noted that the Building Services and Legal Departments will be using the Property Maintenance Code in place of Building and Housing Codes in an effort to undertake a more effective and comprehensive enforcement approach to some of the long-standing enforcement items on the report.

FY2013 Historic Preservation Capital Budget

Staff Member Johnson reviewed that the Planning Services Department's Capital Improvement Program budget for historic preservation has 3 CIPs, which are the Historic Preservation Homeowner Program, Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Fund and Historic District Public Improvement Program. He explained that Planning Services staff has been discussing restructuring the Historic District Public Improvement Program to provide funds for consultant fees to prepare National Register of Historic Places nominations, historic surveys and evaluations, as well as assistance in preparing preservation tax credit applications.

Staff Member Johnson noted over the last few years, HDPIP has funded site-specific projects rather than neighborhood streetscape projects, as initially envisioned. He also noted that providing financial assistance in preparing surveys, National Register of Historic Places nominations and tax credit applications would be a very effective use of funding for preserving and enhancing historic properties and places. He explained a small investment in a National Register nomination, survey and evaluation, or tax credit application can connect people and projects to substantial financial programs to assist in the redevelopment of properties and neighborhoods. Conversely, he noted a small investment in a streetscape project does not go very far. The Commission discussed the restructuring of the program and noted that these projects may not occur in historic districts but are oftentimes precursors to the establishment of local and National Register historic districts.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Whalen, to recommend the Historic District Public Improvement Program be restructured to include consultant fees for National Register of Historic Places nominations, survey and evaluation projects, and Federal and State preservation tax credit applications, as eligible expenses. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Olson, Whalen, Rapp, Wand and McDonnell; Nay – None.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 6:21 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Laura Carstens, Planning Services Manager

Adopted—November 17, 2011