

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, December 14, 2023

City Council Chambers, Historic Federal Building Room 250

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Melissa Daykin Cassill; Commissioners Thea Dement, Bill Doyle, Janice Esser, Tim Gau and Heidi Pettitt

Commissioners Excused: Christina Monk and Rick Stuter

Commissioners Unexcused: None

Staff Members Present: Wally Wernimont, Chris Happ Olson and Matt O'Brien

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Daykin Cassill at 5:30 p.m.

MINUTES: Motion by Esser, seconded by Gau, to approve the minutes of the October 19, 2023 meeting as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Dement, Doyle, Esser, Gau, Pettitt and Daykin Cassill; Nay – none.

ACTION ITEMS:

DEMOLITION PERMIT

Applicant: Gronen
Owner: Molo Oil Company
Address: 897 Central Avenue
Project: Demolition of existing Big Ten Mart for Dubuque Forward Pocket Park
District: Downtown Neighborhood Conservation District

Staff Member Happ Olson presented the staff report noting that the property is in the Downtown Neighborhood Conservation District. She provided the Commission imagery and history of the property. This included 1891-1970 Sanborn maps, Kriviskey 1978-79 Survey, Jacobsen 2003 Phase III Survey, and 1933-2000 building permits showing alterations to the existing building. The existing building, proposed to be demolished by the applicant, does not appear on the Sanborn maps. According to the building permits, the building was constructed in 1972. Happ Olson stated that the surveys show the building on the property is non-supporting and non-contributing. She also stated that the building has held a Vacant Building License since 2019.

Commissioner Dement asked Staff if the structures present on the 1891-1909 Sanborn maps were torn down. Staff Member Happ Olson stated that they were torn down.

Emmett Clair, 1658 W. Menzemer Road, Elizabeth, IL, representing applicant Gronen, spoke to the Commission. He stated that Gronen and Dubuque Forward desire to remove the Big 10 Mart from the city's landscape and create something new. Clair also stated that underground utilities have been removed and other utilities will be removed within the remaining structure.

Chairperson Daykin Cassill stated that she approves demolition of the structure since it is not historically nor architecturally significant. Commissioner Gau said that he agrees with Daykin Cassill.

Motion by Dement, seconded by Gau, approve the application as submitted since the structure is not architecturally nor historically significant. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Dement, Doyle, Esser, Gau, Pettitt and Daykin Cassill; Nay – none.

DESIGN REVIEW

Applicant: GRTD Investments, LLC
Owner: GRTD Investments, LLC
Address: 656-662 W. 11th Street
Project: Replace asphalt shingle roof with stamped metal roof
District: West 11th Street Historic District

Staff Member Happ Olson presented the staff report noting that the structure is a duplex in a local historic district. She stated the applicant is seeking approval for the metal roof installation on the structure. The roof was previously covered with asphalt shingles. Happ Olson provided to the Commission Pictometry imagery, photos from the public-right-of-way, Kriviskey 1978-79 survey, Jacobsen 2003 Phase IV survey information, building permit records, and 1891-1970 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, among other information. The structure is shown as supportive in the Kriviskey Survey and contributing in the Jacobsen Survey. She stated that the Commission shall consider the request for rehabilitation as if the structure has not yet been altered.

Commissioner Gau asked staff for clarification on the approval process. Staff Member Happ Olson stated that a project with no material change of appearance can be signed off on through staff approval and that different material and design requires Commission approval, which is why the project is before the Commission. Commissioner Dement asked staff to explain the distinctive architectural characteristics for the structure as contributing. Happ Olson stated that the structure has been modified over the years, but the early 20th century duplex form has been maintained and the structure contributes to the character and fabric of the neighborhood. Commissioner discussed whether the roof was as shiny in person as it is in the photos. Happ Olson stated that the photos are a good representation. Commissioner Dement said that she drove by the property and the sheen was noticeable.

Rhonda Lampe, representing GRTD Investments, at 3250 Kennedy Circle, Dubuque, spoke to the Commission. She stated that she believes that the metal roof does not distract. Lampe also stated that miscommunication occurred between GRTD and the roofing contractor. Commissioner Doyle asked her if she is a property manager for GRTD. Lampe stated that she is a property manager. Commissioner Esser stated that she has issue with the roof being uneven and wavy in appearance. Chairperson Daykin Cassill stated that guidelines need to be followed even though roof has been changed throughout the years. Commissioner Esser stated that she prefers for metal roofs a darker color and lower sheen. Commissioner Dement asked if there is a way to apply matte or texture to the roof. Staff member Happ Olson stated that would likely void the warranty for the roof if we required a post-installation modification. Commissioner Doyle stated that the asphalt shingle was not historically significant and he can approve of a metal roof that is not steep with a low profile. Commissioner Esser stated that she can approve of a metal roof if its matte and low profile. Commissioner Dement does not approve of a shiny metal roof. Chairperson Daykin Cassill stated that she would like to see something with less reflection and more texture. Commissioner Esser asked if seams and roof edges can be covered up. Staff Happ Olson stated that larger gutters can hide roof edges, like a Yankee Gutter that is a visible historic feature. She stated that in this situation, the roof does not meet most of the qualities that are outlined in the Architectural Guidelines under consideration for metal roofs. She stated that there are other details like texture, design and color which could have helped make the roof appropriate, but this was installed in a way that attracts attention to the roof.

Motion by Gau, seconded by Dement, to approve the application as submitted. Motion denied by the following vote: Aye – Gau; Nay – Dement, Doyle, Esser, Pettitt and Daykin Cassill.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: None

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION: None

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

194 Alpine Street: Staff and Commission discussed the spacing of spindles and profile of railing not meeting the Certificate of Appropriateness approved by the Commission on September 28, 2023. The Commission would like staff to ensure that the conditions for Certificate of Appropriateness approval are being followed, especially in regards to the profile of the railing and the spacing of the spindles.

HPC Workplan Discussion: Staff updated the 2023 Workplan which was included in the packet. There were no new additions, but updates to existing items, including in-process grants and a potential 2026 memorial for the historic Rockdale flood. With no comments, Happ Olson stated that she would bring back the edited document for review and approval in January.

Dubuque Brewing and Malting Update: Staff distributed a December 13th Telegraph Herald article via email to the Commission on the date of publication. The article outlined the current state of deconstruction, the climate of the City Council, updates from the developer and the impacts to businesses and neighbors, including the demolition of two houses adjacent to the restaurant the Copper Kettle to accommodate the establishment's parking needs. Happ Olson noted in the email that the buildings are not in a conservation district or local historic district and therefore there is no historic review triggered.

ADJOURNMENT: Motion by Esser, seconded by Gau to adjourn the December 14, 2023 Commission meeting. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Dement, Doyle, Esser, Gau, Pettitt and Daykin Cassill; Nay – none.

The meeting adjourned at 6:34 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Wally Wernimont, Planning Services Director

January 18, 2023
Adopted