



Approved

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, December 20, 2018
Auditorium, Carnegie Stout Public Library

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Emily Hilgendorf, Commissioners David Klavitter, John McAndrews, Rick Stuter and Joseph Rapp.

Commissioners Excused: Christy Monk, Al Kopczyk, Brandi Clark, Melissa Daykin-Cassill.

Commissioners Unexcused: None.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens and Chris Happ Olson.

CALL TO ORDER: Meeting was called to order by Chairperson Hilgendorf at 5:30 pm.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Motion by Rapp, second by Stuter, to approve the minutes of the November 15, 2018 meeting as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Rapp, McAndrews, Stuter and Hilgendorf; Nay – None; Abstain—Klavitter.

DEMOLITION PERMIT: Application of Gronen Restoration, Inc. as agent to demolish the building located at 2035 Washington Street in the Washington Street Neighborhood Conservation District.

Staff Member Olson reviewed and outlined the staff report. She noted the location of the said property at the rear of the lot that contains both 2035 and 2033 Washington Street. The ownership of the structure is in a trust with no heirs and the bank has allowed the True North organization to be the applicant for the demolition permit. Olson reviewed that the structure was surveyed by both Kriviskey as non-supportive and Jacobsen as contributing. She reviewed the property's age as pre-1872 due to supportive documentation and outlined the changes in appearance over time. She stated the Fire in January 2018 caused extensive structural damage, along with the complications of ownership delaying action, resulting in a property has been open to the elements for most of 2018. She explained that Dubuque's True North has permission to rehab the

structure at 2033 Washington, which is an adjacent brick structure and reviewed the role of the Commission, in light of the conflicting evaluations by consultants.

Emmett Clair, representing Gronen Restoration at 900 Jackson Street, spoke noting the property is severely damaged and they have been unable to access the structure due to the condemnation by the Fire Department, physical boarding of windows and the padlocking and screwing shut of doors. Due to the interior condition, they are requesting to demolish the building. Clair explained the group was working with the bank and Drake Law Firm to find an eligible house for Dubuque's True North organization, and they settled on restoring/rehabilitating 2033 Washington and deconstructing 2035 Washington. Clair noted EMSI is on contract to remove the asbestos and further said that the Fire Department has condemned the property so the structure is secured against squatters, for safety.

Commissioners discussed the lack of action due to the issues with the property ownership, Fire safety and exposure to the elements for almost a year. Several Commissioners said they felt damage is extensive and should be condemned and demolished.

Ed Raber, 2090 Hale Street, working at 900 Jackson Street for Greater Dubuque Development Corporation, spoke. He stated that a potential buyer is the Dubuque's True North, collaborating with the City to purchase dilapidated housing, rehabilitate to City standards, and then sell to a low-moderate income household for homeownership. He noted retaining and rehabilitating 2035 Washington would pose an economic hardship for Dubuque's True North and would have to likely back out of the purchase of 2033 Washington.

Bill Doyle, 1791 Central in Dubuque, stated that he feels an argument can be made that this is a contributing structure to this district and that it suffered from demolition by neglect.

Commissioners continued to discuss the conditions and circumstances of the property. Commissioner Klavitter noted that he felt the structure was historically or architecturally significant and that he wished there was more information from the last people that had been in the property.

Motion by Rapp, second by Stuter, to approve the applicant's request for demolition permit based on its lack of historical and architectural significance. Motion carried by the following vote: Motion approved by the following vote: Aye—Stuter, Rapp, McAndrews, and Hilgendorf; Nay—Klavitter; Abstain—None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of George Murphy, Murphy Construction Group, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for 315-321 Bluff Street in the Cathedral Historic District.

Staff Member Olson reviewed the project noting that the application was for both sides of the structure. She reviewed the structure's age, dating to approximately 1872-73, the physical characteristics and past and present use. She noted it is a twin to its neighbor to the north which is dated the same time and that overall the structure is largely intact. It has had a number of changes over time, including the initial building and rebuilding of its front porch, which currently dates to 2003. She reviewed the two-part request to 1) replace the decking on the front porch and the stair treads with a synthetic decking, and 2) the replacement of porch railings and posts (not columns) from wood to metal. She noted that both requests replace wood with non-original or historic materials.

Staff Member Olson referred the Commission to the guidelines and noted that although the proposal touches on many guidelines it doesn't fit neatly within any one particular guideline. She noted that even though the porch and design is non-original, if the applicant had wanted to simply repair or replace in-kind, then they could request a staff sign-off, but because new materials and design elements are introduced, the request comes to the Commission. The guidelines referenced in the staff report include: using alternative materials, rehabilitation of historic porches, and repair of a porch. The Commission agreed to split the project into two reviews for the decking and treads, and the railing and posts.

Julie Berstler, 315 Bluff Street, has been a tenant in the property for over a decade and is now the property owner. She seen many repairs to the porch over the years. She expressed her desire to have a low-maintenance porch that is still attractive.

George Murphy, 4970 Northrange Court, is the contractor and spoke that he would like to use the composite decking for stair treads, but not risers. He noted they would fabricate the metal posts and railings, powder-coated black. He confirmed the porch columns would stay and newel posts would be similar to those submitted in the photographs he supplied, included in the staff report. The handrail detail would be followed, according to the drawing he submitted from the Building Department, that was included in the staff report. The decking sample was distributed for viewing by staff. Commissioners questioned whether the ends of the rails will be goose-necked, and that the railing is being entirely replaced in this proposal at the porch, down the stairs, and in the yard. Murphy confirmed that the rail would terminate at the posts and that the proposal is for all the railings. Murphy stated that the stairs were rotted, as was the porch floor, hence the replacement request.

Decking Discussion: Commissioners and staff discussed the use of alternative materials for porch decking and recalled examples of cement board and other materials being approved in the past, particularly in moist areas and up high on details like soffits. The Commission confirmed with the contractor that the stringers would remain as wood, with no risers, and stair treads would be the composite material proposed, maintaining the vertical profile of the porch. Commissioners discussed they would be open to allowing this as an option on this property and the desire to monitor how the exception performs. Reasoning for allowing this was because it was a small portion of the porch affected

and that staff and Commission would be able to see the performance after a freeze/thaw cycle. Also discussed was using the texture side facing up in this case.

Motion by Klavitter, second by Stuter, to approve use of Paramount PVC Decking (color Sandstone on decking and stair treads. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye—Stuter, Rapp, Klavitter, McAndrews and Hilgendorf; Nay—None; Abstain—None.

Railing Discussion: Commissioners discussed the proposed new railing and posts, in reference to the guidelines and non-original porch which is based on designs of other traditional porches or similar architectural style. Staff Member Olson confirmed that the yard railings (not on the house or porch) and the color of materials is outside the Commissioners' purview. Commissioners confirmed with the contractor that the porch railing was rotted, and the need for replacement verses repair.

Motion by Klavitter, second by Rapp, to approve the replacement of wood railings/posts with metal as proposed. Motion failed by the following vote: Aye—McAndrews; Nay—Stuter, Rapp, Klavitter, and Hilgendorf; Abstain—None.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION:

A. Discussion of events in HPC 2019 Events & Actives packet enclosure:

- a. Historic Preservation Month: general agreement to maintain the staff-supported activities #1-4, with HPC Chair to promote with City Council and push via social media. Start 1-2 months prior to May. Activity #5 to be coordinated by Chair, with staff supporting to take photos or have subjects provide selfies.
- b. Preservation Fair: Committee to set up event, including Commissioners Hilgendorf, Rapp and Klavitter with staff support. Staff to request of those Commissioners not present as to whether they would like to join. Commissioners asked whether we have a list of Ken Kringle award winners and staff reported we have them listed on the website, but not a contact database for inviting them to our event. Kickoff meeting in January for outreach and planning.
- c. Partners/Promo Existing Events: Staff Members Carstens and Olson, with members of HPC to all work to cross promote events that are generated by HPC or our partners.
- d. Possible Large-Scale Events in Future: No discussion.

B. A follow-up discussion from arose on desire from Commissioner Klavitter to be provided more accurate existing condition information after a Fire or similar major

change which triggers a condemnation, with reference to a report from the appropriate Department. Staff agreed to make this available.

- C. Commissioners had a follow-up discussion on monitoring the performance of alternate materials 1-2 years after installation to track performance. Commissioners requested that staff look back at those examples and provide list to observe performance, along with tracking the new materials at 315-321 Bluff Street. Staff agreed to compile this information.

ITEMS FROM STAFF: Staff briefly reported on and referred to three grant contracts for:

- CLG Grant for Four Mounds Park
- CLG Grant for 2020 Preserve Iowa Summit
- REAP Grant for Four Mounds Park

Staff also reported that although the City has not yet received a contract, the Iowa Great Places awarded a grant to the Ham House.

STAFF APPROVALS: Staff Member Carstens reported that the City does not yet have a staff signoff report due to a change in the permit system in July 2018. The City's Information Services Department is still working on developing a way to populate reports for just historic properties. The anticipation is that it will be available sometime in the near future.

ADJOURNMENT: Motion by Klavitter, seconded by Rapp, to adjourn the December 20, 2018 Commission meeting. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Stuter, McAndrews, Rapp and Hilgendorf; Nay – None.

The meeting adjourned at 7:20 pm.

Respectfully submitted,



Laura Carstens, Planning Services Manager

2-21-19

Adopted