



Approved

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, March 15, 2012
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Chairperson David Klavitter; Commissioners Chris Olson, Mary Loney-Bichell, Joseph Rapp, Chris Wand, Mitzi Krey and Bob McDonell.

Commissioners Excused: Commissioner John Whalen.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens and David Johnson.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Klavitter at 5:31 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Motion by Wand, seconded by McDonell, to approve the minutes of the November 17, 2011 and January 19, 2012 meetings as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Krey and McDonell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Rudy & Shawn Vera for a Certificate of Appropriateness to add a deck and roof to a porch for property located at 560 Wilbur Street in the W. 11th Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, describing the property and the proposal. He reviewed the details of the deck proposal as to construction, materials, location, dimensions and finishes. He also reviewed details of the porch, and noted drawings. He requested that the Commission condition any approval on the applicant obtaining a special exception for the Zoning Board of Adjustment for the setbacks, and approval of a revocable license from the City Manager for encroachment into the public right-of-way.

Commissioners discussed the occupancy and configuration of the property with staff.

Rudy Vera, 970 Olive Street, reviewed the plans and noted the lack of outdoor space for the lower unit due to steep topography. He felt the new deck would provide needed outdoor space.

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

March 15, 2012

Page 2

Commissioners discussed the proposal with the applicant. They reviewed the current improvements to remain, and the new deck and property lines. Commissioners reviewed the front porch, hip roof, railings, and columns, and discussed that fascia board, railings and other wood elements need to be painted or opaque stained. Mr. Vera agreed.

Commissioners discussed the existing concrete under the deck, and how it will be treated. Mr. Vera explained he will likely pour concrete for the porch. Commissioners discussed the style of lattice noting it should be horizontal rather than vertical. They referenced a historic property on Spruce Street. Commissioners discussed the number of columns and recommended using two larger columns instead. Mr. Vera agreed with two larger columns. Mr. Vera answered questions as to where the gutter, downspouts and stairs will be.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Wand, to approve the front porch on Wilbur as presented with the following conditions:

- 1) Two columns be 6" by 6" or larger and use two columns instead of three columns;
- 2) Gutters run back toward the house for drainage;
- 3) Entire structure be painted or opaque stained to look like paint;
- 4) Use of horizontal instead of diagonal lattice; and
- 5) Use of a trim board between the deck and lattice.

Commissioners discussed the deck, noting concerns with the size of deck on a prominent façade. Commissioners suggested a smaller deck to be no wider than the house, perhaps 8' by 10', or 10' by 10', to keep it within line or "notch" of the house and encroach less into the public right-of-way. Commissioners discussed the design guidelines and the unique configuration, proximity to the street and loss of integrity for this property. Commissioners discussed cutting the deck area by 50% to be in proportion to the house. Mr. Vera felt an 8' x 10' deck was inadequate, and he requested the deck be withdrawn from the application.

Motion by Wand, seconded by McDonell, to accept the applicant's withdrawal. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Krey and McDonell; Nay – None.

Motion by Wand, seconded by McDonell, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for the porch be contingent on approval of a special exception and revocable license. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Krey and McDonell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Scott Hendron for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new downspouts for property located at 1433 Main Street in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the proposal, discussing the analysis and planning done by the applicant as to the need for new downspouts in front of the window sets, now prohibited by the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Scott Hendron, 1433 Main Street, presented a PowerPoint presentation on the downspout situation and previous Certificate of Appropriateness. He reviewed options he has explored for the 3,000 square feet of roof space to be drained. He referenced the neighboring property, with downspouts painted to match the brick, in front of the window sets. He had examples of other properties in the district with similar downspouts in front of their window sets. Mr. Hendron reviewed the gutter sizes needed. He stated if he is not allowed to put gutters and downspouts in front of window sets, excessively large gutters would be required in the back. He summarized his request and his concerns. He discussed side and rear drainage issues, examples of neighboring properties, and requested the Commission strike the language on downspouts in the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioners commended Mr. Hendron on the quality of his presentation, and noted that the Commission reviews projects on a case-by-case basis. Commissioners discussed the additions to the original building putting pressure on the drainage system, and having a downspout painted to match the brick.

Commissioners discussed the feasibility of putting downspouts behind the windows, and then running drainage piping to the front. The applicant and staff discussed the sidewalk and fence that are in the side yards. Commissioners noted their careful review of the Yankee gutters and maintaining their appearance in approving the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioners discussed concerns with the look of the downspout interrupting the look of the brackets at the cornice. The applicant and Commission discussed locating the downspouts in a less obtrusive place behind the two corner brackets 2-3 feet away, and “hug” the cornice more. Commissioners discussed how the first elbow of the downspout could turn and be closer to the 2nd bracket to reduce its profile. Commissioners discussed with the applicant painting the downspout to match the cornice, brick, and limestone foundation.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Olson, to modify the previous Certificate of Appropriateness to allow downspouts in front of the window sets with a recommendation that they be held back behind the second bracket; be configured to hug the cornice to reduce the profile, and be painted to match the cornice and brick.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Krey and McDonell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of the City of Dubuque for a Historic District Public Improvement Program application for decking, a railing and a sidewalk approach for the White Water Creek Bridge Landmark located in the Bergfeld Recreation Area along Chavenelle Road.

Staff Member Carstens reviewed the staff report, and the history and significance of the bridge. She reviewed the State grant funds already invested in the project. Staff Member Johnson reviewed project challenges and progress to date. Staff Member Carstens explained the HDPIP grant would provide necessary funding to finish the project. She stated the HDPIP request would reserve the remaining HDPIP funds as well as next fiscal year's allocation. In response to a question from the Commission, staff noted half the cost had been covered with \$85,000 in grants.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Bichell, to approve the request for HDPIP funds as proposed. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Krey and McDonell; Nay – None.

EDUCATION TASK FORCE:

Update on Public Outreach and Education Program: Chairperson Klavitter updated the Commission on the Education Task Force. He explained he spoke at an Old House Enthusiasts meeting and provided the Phase V survey in preparation for their annual tour of homes. He stated the Old House Enthusiasts offered to provide the historic preservation brochures at the tour of homes.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: None.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION:

Architecture Days: The Commission discussed the upcoming Architecture Days. Chairperson Klavitter stated he approached Brian Cooper of the Telegraph Herald, and asked to prepare an op-ed to be run the week of Architecture Days. The Commission discussed the content of the op-ed. Commissioner Wand reviewed Architecture Days building tours. Staff Member Johnson clarified Architecture Days will run April 16th -21st and the schedule has not been finalized. Staff Member Johnson stated he will email Commissioners the schedule of events once finalized. He noted Commissioners are encouraged to attend all the events, but the HPC's Ken Kringle award ceremony will be particularly important for Commissioners to be at.

Architecture Retrospective Project: Commissioner Olson described the architecture retrospective project that her husband Tim Olson was undertaking. She asked if the Commission would like a short presentation on the project. The Commission agreed.

Staff Member Johnson requested Mr. Olson contact him in advance of the meeting he would like to present at.

560 Wilbur Street: Commissioner Wand felt the Commission had taken the correct action on the proposed size of the deck, but was disappointed at the applicant's withdrawal. Commissioners asked staff to encourage Mr. Vera to reconsider some options on size, and then come back to the Commission for another review.

Ryan House – Becker Stone: The Commission discussed the work that was started at the Ryan House, 1375 Locust Street. Staff Member Johnson stated that the property owner confirmed Becker Stone has salvaged the stone and is keeping it off-site. Staff Member Johnson added that the property owner is undertaking a lot of landscaping work, but the approved retaining wall is still part of the plan.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Update of State Historic Preservation Plan: Staff Member Carstens explained Ryan Dierks with Smart Growth Development contacted her about how the City of Dubuque can assist with a public input session as part of the update of the Statewide Preservation Plan. She explained Mr. Dierks serves on the Advisory Committee for the Plan's update. She stated Commissioners are encouraged to review and comment on the plan.

The Commission discussed the public input session. The Commission noted the April meeting conflicts with Architecture Days, and recommended the input session be done in conjunction with the May meeting. Commissioner McDonell recommended a media release to promote the public input session.

FY 2013-2017 Historic Preservation CIPs: Staff Member Carstens reviewed the new CIPs for historic preservation activities. She noted the CIPs reflect the recommendations of the Commission. She reviewed the CIPs noting they are for additional funding to the HDPIP program, historic preservation technical assistance and historic/architectural surveys and evaluations. The Commission noted HDPIP funding has increased from \$10,000 per year to \$25,000 annually.

The Commission expressed appreciation for the show of support for historic preservation. Staff Member Carstens noted the funding will go a long way in leveraging state funds and help connect people to tax credits, especially in the small projects category where up-front costs are often times a substantial obstacle.

2011 CLG Report: The Commission received and filed the report.

2011 Ken Kringle Award Nominations and Ceremony: Staff presented two projects, and requested any other projects to be honored. The Commission discussed eligible projects. The consensus of the Commission was to nominate the Riverworks project at

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

March 15, 2012

Page 6

40-44 Main Street, the Washington Street row houses at 1765-1795 Washington Street, and the White House Restoration at the Four Mounds Estate.

Commissioners discussed noteworthy work at the Faber house on Grove Terrace and Wilbur Street, and a house at the top of Spruce Street. Commissioners noted that these smaller projects could be recognized with a certificate issued quarterly to good projects that may not rise to the level of a Ken Kringle award. Commissioners also discussed a “round-up” of roofs, windows, porches, etc. and an award category for individuals. The consensus of the Commission was to follow-up on certificates or letters of recognition for smaller projects.

National Historic Preservation Month: Staff Member Johnson reviewed the National Trust for Historic Preservation list of activities and suggested the Commission consider the list. He asked the Chair to be at the May 7th City Council meeting to accept the Historic Preservation Month proclamation. Staff noted the Task Force suggested a program for residents on researching historic resources and suggested Planning staff and other community resources could be tapped for the program. Commissioners directed staff to put together a program for May 2012.

Building Services Historic Preservation Enforcement Report Update: Staff Member Johnson noted the updates are shown in bold. Commissioners asked if the new owners of the property at 1163 Highland would be aware of the pending violations. Commissioners asked Planning Services staff to check with Legal staff as to whether citations (issued or pending) can be recorded

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 7:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Laura Carstens, Planning Services Manager

Adopted—April 19, 2012