



Approved

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, July 21, 2011
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Chairperson David Klavitter; Commissioners Chris Wand, Chris Olson, John Whalen, Joseph Rapp, Bob McDonell and Mitzi Krey.

Commissioners Excused: Commissioners Mary Loney-Bichell and Michael Knight.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens, David Harris, David Johnson and Wally Wernimont.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Klavitter at 5:33 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

WELCOME NEW COMMISSIONER: The Commission welcomed Commissioner Krey to the Commission. Commissioner Krey introduced herself to the Commission and briefly reviewed her background.

MINUTES: Two corrections were noted on Page 5 under Items from Commission.

Motion by Wand, seconded by McDonell, to approve the minutes of the June 16, 2011 meeting as corrected. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Wand, Olson, Whalen, Klavitter, Rapp, McDonell and Krey; Nay - None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Judge Builders/The Angels, LLC for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new entrance for property located at 605 Bluff Street in the Cathedral Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report and the request. He explained the applicant is requesting to replace the double-window centered on the Mary of the Angels Annex building with a new entrance, noting the new entrance will have a double-wood doors and transom to fit the same opening. He explained the entrance will have a canvas awning with aluminum frame and glass panels enclosing the sides. Staff Member Johnson stated a new concrete walkway will be installed between the entrance and the sidewalk, and cut limestone retaining walls with cast concrete caps will be located on each side of the walkway.

Aiman Al-Qady, Judge Builders, 605 Bluff Street, described site constraints, alternatives considered, and safety considerations. He noted the front of the building is the only location where a new commercial entrance can safely be added. He requested approval for his project.

Commissioners discussed the proposal. Commissioners noted that this is a new design element and suggested using a retractable awning without glass enclosures. The Commission explained it would be a more appropriate and less expensive way to create a recognizable entrance. Commissioners discussed with the applicant how the entrance relates to the grade. Commissioners also discussed dimensions of the awning and its location with respect to the headers with the applicant. Mr. Al-Qady confirmed the stone water table will not be removed or altered as part of the project. Commissioners discussed possible revisions to the design. Commissioners felt the awning should extend no more than four to five feet, and support posts would be acceptable, if needed.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Olson, to approve the application as submitted with the following conditions:

1. The awning be shortened to four to five feet on either side;
2. The glass enclosure not be installed; and
3. If a self-supporting awning can't be installed, then support posts are acceptable.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Wand, Olson, Klavitter, Whalen, Rapp, McDonell and Krey; Nay - None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Gary and Ann Kluesner for a Certificate of Appropriateness to add two porches for property located at 1025/1027/1037 Locust Street in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report and the request, noting materials, dimensions, roof style and pitch, color and construction of the two porches proposed. He noted differences in the proposal from pictures included in the packet.

Gary Kluesner, 10400 Timothy, explained why he wants to install the two porches to protect the landing and improve the building's entrances.

Commissioners discussed the possible pitch, dimensions and design concepts for a hip roof versus a shed roof as proposed. Commissioners noted there is evidence that a hip roof was in place originally, and this roof style was preferable. Commissioners commended Mr. Kluesner on the fine appearance of the building, and felt it is an example for other properties that are not as well maintained. Mr. Kluesner distributed a photo of a hip roof example of a property on 17th Street. Mr. Kluesner offered to add

dentils and brackets to reflect the building's cornice details. Commissioners agreed. Motion by Whalen, seconded by Wand, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

- 1) A hip roof to follow ghost lines of the original porch roofs;
- 2) Brackets as proposed or that match the cornice brackets; and
- 3) Fascia can be as proposed or can match the fascia on main roof.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Wand, Olson, Klavitter, Whalen, Rapp, McDonell and Krey; Nay - None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Alfred Kopczyk for a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair the retaining wall located at 1375 Locust Street in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, noting the important historical significance of the Ryan House. He then reviewed the proposal, the condition of the retaining wall, and the proposed design alternatives for the retaining wall and ornate iron fence. He noted the enclosed engineering drawings. He also noted the applicant's documentation of vandalism to the property, especially the original wrought iron fencing. Staff Member Johnson explained the property owner and Dubuque County Historical Society only have a few remaining sections of the original fencing in storage, and the applicant does not intend on reinstalling the fencing because of its susceptibility to vandalism.

Al Kopczyk, 1320 Locust Street, reviewed the history of improvements to his property and the neighborhood. He reviewed his agreement with the Dubuque County Historical Society, conditions of the building and retaining wall, and problems with vandalism. He asked for Commission guidance on alternatives that will withstand the vandalism damage and address insurance company concerns with re-installing the retaining wall and ornate fencing. He noted he has had several insurance companies drop his coverage on the property. He noted he has received a notice from the City's Housing and Community Development Department regarding the condition of the wall.

Commissioners discussed the proposal and site constraints, and noted some examples of similar stone retaining walls in the downtown area, such as St. Raphael's Cathedral. Commissioners discussed the condition of the stone, and possible grade changes with construction of the wall. Mr. Kopczyk discussed several alternatives. Commissioners felt repair of the existing wall was preferable. Commissioners discussed the proposal for a new foundation, wall repair, and wall cap with the applicant. Commissioners also discussed iron fencing options. The Commission expressed support of a more durable ornate metal fencing material to be placed on top of the wall at a future date.

Commissioners asked staff what the terms are of the agreement between Mr. Kopczyk and the Dubuque County Historical Society. Staff noted they do not have a copy of the

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

July 21, 2011

Page 4

agreement, but can obtain a copy if it is a public record. Mr. Kopczyk explained he works closely with the Dubuque County Historical Society and the City in making improvements to the property.

Commissioners reviewed the options, and reached a consensus that the wall be repaired with in-kind materials if possible. Mr. Kopczyk asked for time to get a cost estimate for repair, and then come back to discuss alternatives.

The Commission again reviewed with the applicant the condition of the stone, the existing construction of the stone wall facing, and options for rebuilding it.

Commissioners reviewed the drawings showing piers nine-foot on center, and a concrete footing and foundation for structural support. Mr. Kopczyk explained the existing wall materials will be rebuilt around the new, stronger concrete wall rather than the stone base which is failing. Commissioners felt repairing and rebuilding the wall with salvaged and existing stone on the concrete foundation and footing was the preferred option. Commissioners noted the wall height should be maintained so it is even with the neighbor's wall and adequate backfill be provided for proper drainage.

Mr. Kopczyk asked the Commission to table the request to allow him an opportunity to obtain estimates to replace damaged stone caps and fascia with cut limestone rather than the cast concrete as proposed. He felt he can get an extension past August 8th from the Dubuque County Historical Society to repair the retaining wall. He also asked if he can remove falling stones back off the wall per the City's request. The Commission agreed to removing and safely storing the stones for reuse.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Whalen, to table the request at the applicant's request. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Wand, Olson, Klavitter, Whalen, Rapp, McDonell and Krey; Nay - None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of DuTrac Community Credit Union/Regina McCarty for a demolition permit to demolish the building located at 1376 Washington Street in the Washington Neighborhood Conservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, noting the applicant, DuTrac Community Credit Union, on behalf of the owner, Regina McCarty, has requested a demolition permit in a conservation district. He noted the building has been surveyed and evaluated under the *Phase III Architectural and Historical Survey Report-Downtown Dubuque*. He stated the building has been identified as non-contributing to the potential Old Town Residential National Register of Historic Places District. He explained the Commission's duties under the Unified Development Code for this type of request.

Tom Anderson, Senior Vice President of Operations, DuTrac Community Credit Union, 3465 Asbury Road, reviewed the relationship of DuTrac with Mrs. McCarty regarding her interest to sell the property. He explained that DuTrac has no interest in maintaining

the rental property, and desires to remove the structure for additional parking.

Commissioners noted the building is non-supportive in the Kriviskey 1979 Survey and non-contributing in the Jacobsen 2003 Survey.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Wand, to approve the request noting the building is not historically or architecturally significant and recommends that the building be deconstructed and materials be diverted from the landfill to the greatest extent possible. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Wand, Olson, Klavitter, Whalen, Rapp, McDonell and Krey; Nay - None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of David Harris, City Housing and Community Development Director, for a demolition permit to demolish the building located at 1753 Washington Street in the Washington Neighborhood Conservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, the Commission's role and the building's level of significance. He explained the building has been surveyed and evaluated under the *Phase III Architectural and Historical Survey Report-Downtown Dubuque* and has been identified as non-contributing to the potential Old Town Residential National Register of Historic Places District.

David Harris, City Housing and Community Development Director, reviewed that the property would be used for parking for the adjoining historic row house rehabilitation project.

Commissioners noted the building's level of significance was non-supportive in the Kriviskey 1979 survey and non-contributing in the Jacobsen 2003 survey.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Wand, to approve the request noting the building is not historically or architecturally significant. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Wand, Olson, Klavitter, Whalen, Rapp, McDonell and Krey; Nay - None.

SECTION 106 REVIEW AND COMMENT – 2234 WASHINGTON STREET:

Application by the City of Dubuque for Section 106 review and comment to rehabilitate the building located at 2234 Washington Street in the Washington Neighborhood Conservation District.

Commissioner Olson excused herself from the table due to her involvement in the HEART Program with the property.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, and the accompanying documentation.

Staff Member Wernimont reported this property was acquired by the City for the Bee Branch Creek Restoration Project. He explained the property will have a reduced yard due to the project. He explained the Housing and Community Development Department

will be using Federal Neighborhood Stabilization Program (NSP) funds for rehab of the property. He noted the property is part of the Washington Street and E. 22nd Street National Register Historic District. He noted it will be rehabbed and sold as a single-family residence. He then explained the Section 106 consultation process for potential impacts to historic resources using federal funds. He noted that for many housing rehab projects, Planning Services staff can conduct the review in-house. Staff Member Carstens explained that for certain projects, the State Historic Preservation Office requires additional consultation with the Historic Preservation Commission. She requested Historic Preservation Commission concurrence with staff's findings.

Commissioners reviewed the project. Commissioner Wand noted some wording on the bid form that he felt would make the project more easily bid. Commissioners asked about a source for Voelker stone if needed. Staff Member Wernimont briefly explained the history of the Voelker Homes and sources for the pre-cast stone.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Whalen, to issue a letter on behalf of the Historic Preservation Commission that the Commission concurs with the Planning Services Department findings that the undertaking will have no adverse effect to the historic property; rather, it will enhance the property. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Wand, Klavitter, Whalen, Rapp, McDonell and Krey; Nay – None; Abstain - Olson.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Four Mounds Foundation for Historic District Public Improvement Program Funds to prepare a site survey for the Four Mounds Estate.

Commissioner Olson excused herself from the table to present the proposal as Executive Director of Four Mounds Foundation.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the project, the HDPIP funding parameters, and the grant request. He explained the application states the site survey is necessary to accurately estimate and projects at the estate. He noted that the survey will allow Four Mounds to move forward with the Public Improvement Project and utilize the remaining \$91,200 allocated for the Public Improvement Project in 2008.

Staff Member Johnson noted the survey will be undertaken immediately and the project will be finished by October 2011. Once the survey is complete, the public improvement project will commence. He explained Four Mounds Foundation intends to utilize the remaining \$91,200 and close out the HDPIP grant by June 2012. Staff Member Johnson noted Four Mounds Foundation has applied for a State grant for \$33,737. The grant is for building restoration, the restoration of original hard landscaping features and roadways that, if approved, will serve as the HDPIP match. Staff Member Johnson noted there is currently a balance of \$33,957 remaining in the HDPIP account.

Chris Olson, Four Mounds Foundation, 4900 Peru Road, explained that the necessity for the site survey.

Commissioners questioned the status of the project if the State funding is not awarded.

Ms. Olson noted that if this State grant is not funded, the project may have to be scaled back. Commissioners discussed options for a match other than the State funding. Ms. Olson noted the project's landscape architects donated over \$30,000 for in-kind labor and expenses for the Landscape Heritage Assessment which was also part of the Four Mounds Public Improvement Project, and this donation is documented.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Whalen, to recommend approval of the HDPIP request with the local match to be provided by the previous in-kind consultant services. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Wand, Klavitter, Whalen, Rapp, McDonell and Krey; Nay – None; Abstain - Olson.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC:

Hancock House, 1105 Grove Terrace: Commissioner Olson noted that she is a neighbor and had suggested Mr. Huntley approach the Historic Preservation Commission on the proposed roof work to the property. Chuck Huntley, 1105 Grove Terrace, was present. He explained that he was requesting guidance from the Commission on needed roof work as a result of hail damage. He explained the feedback will be helpful in discussions with his insurance company.

Craig Wall, Premier Exterior Solutions, explained he has experience with historic structures and noted this property is very complex. He also explained that he has an adjustor background. He distributed photos and explained the asbestos mitigation will be one of the biggest challenges for the roof repair. He explained the asbestos roofing, copper sheathing and roof turrets are making the project complex. He reviewed existing roof materials and damage, possible roofing materials and the insurance company's position. He asked for any questions or comments to help move the project forward.

Commissioners asked about the asbestos in the roofing. Mr. Wall explained the removal requirements, and noted he asked three asbestos mitigation contractors for bids. He further reviewed the complexity of replacing the pure copper sheathing, which is no longer made. He provided an asphalt shingle sample.

Commissioners discussed alternative roofing options on neighboring properties. Mr. Wall explained they intend to retain as much of the existing copper on the roof, turrets, and gutters as possible.

Commissioners discussed the shingle sample and the colors available, and where this type of roof has been used on historic properties in Dubuque, such as the Fanny Stout House. Commissioners noted that the Hancock House has natural slate on one of the turret roofs.

Commissioners discussed with Mr. Wall where 400 square feet of flat copper sheeting will be replaced on the roof. Mr. Wall confirmed the copper valleys will be retained.

Commissioners discussed dealing with insurance companies on historic roofs. Mr. Huntley and Mr. Wall reviewed what the insurance company is looking for, and what they are hoping to do, and financial compromise. Mr. Huntley and Mr. Wall agreed.

Commissioners discussed seeing more options for roof shingles, and what options are available. Commissioners wanted to see as much copper retained, and suggested an asphalt shingle that mimicked the existing shingle. Commissioners also asked for photos that depict the areas of flat copper sheathing.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION:

Carnegie Stout Public Library Signs: Commissioners requested a status report on the Carnegie Stout Public Library signs. Staff agreed to place the item on the next available agenda.

624/626 & 634/636 Arlington Street: The Commission questioned the status of the retaining wall treatment between the two buildings. Staff Member Johnson explained the property owner has yet to address that issue.

630 W. 11th Street: The Commission discussed concerns that the Certificate of Appropriateness will not be followed. Staff Member Johnson explained a follow-up email was sent to the property owners reminding them of the Certificate of Appropriateness and offering assistance.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

HPC Education Task Force: Comments on the draft script were provided by Commissioners. Chairperson Klavitter noted that he and Staff Member Johnson were on Mediacom's "Newsleaders" program speaking on historic preservation issues and the Shot Tower Rehabilitation. Commissioners discussed possible projects currently in progress for the video.

Enforcement Report: Staff Member Johnson noted the enclosed report. Commissioners asked that work on 1163 Highland be monitored for compliance with the Certificate of Appropriateness.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 8:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

David Johnson, Assistant Planner

Adopted