



Approved

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, September 16, 2010
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Michael Knight; Commissioners David Klavitter, Chris Olson, John Whalen, Joseph Rapp, Chris Wand, Peggy Stover and Bob McDonnell.

Commissioners Excused: Commissioner Mary Loney Bichell.

Staff Members Present: David Johnson.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Knight at 5:33 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Commissioner Olson noted she was not present for the request to demolish the building at 1007 Central Avenue and she noted she arrived at 5:40 p.m. The Commission stated the last sentence of the 3rd paragraph on page 2 should read, "The Commission recommended that visually the porch columns end at the porch landing where the skirt is shown in the historical photo, rather than, be visible or exposed all the way to the ground as depicted in the construction drawings." The Commission noted the 2nd sentence of the last paragraph, under Items from Public should be changed to state, "The Commission noted that Step-by-Step is perhaps looking for a new project, but this building may not work."

Motion by Klavitter, seconded by Wand, to approve the minutes of the August 19, 2010 meeting with the noted changes. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW/CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS: Application of Tim McNamara / Mission Creative for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a sign located at 801 Jackson Street in the Historic Millwork District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He noted the historical association of the building as well as the review criteria for the sign. He noted the review criteria is explained in detail because the Dubuque Millwork District Master Plan and Historic Millwork District PUD make the area unique and in some instances may justify more flexibility in design compared to one of the city's five local historic districts.

He explained the Dubuque Millwork District Master Plan proposes an approach that

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

September 16, 2010

Page 2

balances the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines and the community's desire to create a unique environment conducive to an expression of creative and artistic endeavors of all types. Staff noted the approach does not seek to freeze the district in time, but rather honor the past while welcoming the future.

Staff Member Johnson noted the Historic Millwork District PUD performance standards are to create viable, equitable and livable mixed use neighborhoods in the Historic Millwork District. He stated the Millwork District includes residential, retail, office, commercial and industrial uses that require both strategy and flexibility for its sustainability. He stated the Historic Millwork District PUD explains the development and maintenance of uses in the Historic Millwork District should follow the goals, objectives, and recommendations of the Historic Millwork District Master Plan. Staff explained the Historic Millwork District PUD sets forth that the design of signage shall comply with the Downtown Design Guidelines for signs and any deviation from those guidelines need to be reviewed by the Commission. Staff explained the proposed sign is consistent with the Downtown Design Guidelines with the exception of the internal illumination.

Keith Wolff, Dubuque Sign Company, 210 Cedar Cross Road, presented the request on behalf of Mr. McNamara and Mission Creative. Mr. Wolff explained all faces of the sign will be routed, and the only thing illuminated will be the letters themselves. He explained the cabinets will have routed aluminum faces bracketed with white acrylic lettering. Mr. Wolff distributed a rendering showing the sign installed along the building's façade. He noted the sign will be flag mounted to the side of the building.

The Commission discussed the appropriateness of allowing internally illuminated signs. The Commission and staff discussed existing internally illuminated signs within the Historic Millwork District; however, it was noted those signs were established prior to the adoption of the Historic Millwork District PUD. The Commission stated the internally illuminated sign is not appropriate, and felt it was important to establish that standard now as the district develops. The Commission noted they supported the aluminum material but could not support the internal illumination. The Commission referred to the Downtown Design Guidelines, which encourage wood or metal signs that are externally illuminated.

Tony Pfohl, Fischer Companies, 200 Main Street, requested an opportunity to speak. Mr. Pfohl noted he was on the task force that participated in developing the Downtown Design Guidelines document. He explained the task force envisioned more flexibility in the Historic Millwork District because of intended use and its unique character.

The Commission discussed limited instances where internally illuminated signs may be appropriate.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Stover, to approve the application as submitted. Motion failed by the following vote: Aye – None; Nay - Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Abstain - None.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: None.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION:

1105 Highland Place: Commissioner Whalen removed himself from the table to address the Commission with issues relating to the previously approved addition to his home. Mr. Whalen discussed using wood with metal tiles designed to look like clay tiles on the north portion of the addition's roof. He noted the material change would be a significant cost savings and that portion of the roof is not visible to anyone. Mr. Whalen also discussed changing the addition's roof form. Mr. Whalen noted he would have his architect submit drawings to Planning staff reflecting the discussed changes for review at a future HPC meeting.

Carnegie Stout Public Library Monument Signs: The Commission discussed how the recently installed monument signs at the Carnegie Stout Public Library were established. The Commission noted the existing sign's design and materials are inappropriate. The Commission noted a previous application by the Carnegie Stout Public Library to review entry plaza improvements, but noted those plans only indicated the location of future monument signs, not a design for those signs. By consensus, the Commission directed staff to look into the issue.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Walker's Shoe Store NRHP Nomination: Staff Member Johnson explained that Mark Hope is the property owner and is unable to attend the meeting. He explained the State Nominations Review Committee will consider the Walker's Shoe Store, 756 Main Street, for nomination to the National Register of Historic Places during their October 8, 2010 meeting. He stated the State Historical Society of Iowa is requesting the Commission review the nomination, and then comment on whether the building meets the necessary significance criteria for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. Staff explained the nomination indicates that the property is locally significant under criteria A and C. Staff explained criterion A is a property that is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history, and criterion C is a property that embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction that represents the work of a master or possesses high artistic values or represents significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.

The Commission disagreed with the nomination's attempt to associate the building in question with Sullivanesque style and details. The Commission stated the building is not a Sullivanesque building regardless of whether the Midland Terracota Company created terracotta for the building that was marketed as reflecting Sullivan's ornamental designs. The Commission felt it would be inaccurate to associate the architect, Louis Sullivan, and Sullivanesque style with this building and its features. The Commission noted that Walker's Shoe Store building is a good representation of a classic Dubuque Downtown building and worthy of nomination to the National Register without an association to Sullivanesque

design. The Commission discussed the building's association with important architect Thomas Carkeek.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Olson, to recommend to the State Nominations Review Committee that the Walker's Shoe Store is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places under criteria A and C with the recommendation that further clarification be included in the nomination as to the connection to Louis Sullivan or Sullivanesque design, and provide more specific information about what elements of the design are considered Sullivanesque, where that determination came from, and form a more local connection rather than Louis Sullivan or Sullivanesque design. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

Washington Street and E. 22nd Street Historic District NRHP Nomination: Staff Member Johnson explained the State Nominations Review Committee will consider this nomination at their October 8, 2010 meeting. The State has requested the Commission review this nomination and also comment as to whether the Washington Street and E. 22nd Street Historic District meets the significance criteria for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. Staff noted the nomination indicates the district meets criterion A. Staff explained criterion A is a property that is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.

The Commission questioned whether all of the buildings within the proposed district boundary are still there. Staff confirmed that all the buildings are intact.

The Commission questioned whether the property owners were notified of the proposed district. Staff explained the State Historical Society of Iowa mailed each property owner notification of the proposed district. The notification included information about listing on the National Register, contact information for questions, and the process for objecting to listing on the National Register. Staff explained the process requires property owners to comment directly to the State Historical Society of Iowa.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Klavitter, to recommend to the State Nominations Review Committee that the Washington Street and E. 22nd Street Historic District is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places based on criterion A. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

Upper Main Street NRHP Historic District Amendment: Staff Member Johnson explained the State Nominations Review Committee will consider the Upper Main Street National Register of Historic Places Historic District Amendment at their October 8, 2010 meeting. The State is requesting the Commission review the nomination and comment on whether the district amendment meets the significance criteria for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. Staff explained the proposed amendment will expand the existing Upper Main Street Historic District to include 909 Main Street, 951 Main Street, 955 Main Street,

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

September 16, 2010

Page 5

and 965 Main Street. Staff explained the nomination states the properties in the expanded area are locally significant under Criteria A and C, which are the same criteria the original district boundary was found to be significant under. Staff noted Tony Pfohl was present for any questions and that he is the sole owner of the properties in the district expansion.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Wand, to recommend to the State Nominations Review Committee that the Upper Main Street National Register of Historic Places Historic District Amendment is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places based on criteria A and C. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

Schroeder-Kleine Grocer Company Warehouse; M.M. Walker Company Warehouse NRHP Nomination: Staff explained this request will be reviewed by the State Nominations Review Committee at their October 8, 2010 meeting. He stated the State is requesting the Commission review the nomination and comment on whether the Schroeder-Kleine Grocery Company Warehouse; M.M. Walker Company Warehouse National Register of Historic Places nomination meets significance criteria for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. He noted the nomination states the property is locally significant under criteria A and C.

The Commission discussed the progress already made in the rehabilitation of the building and noted the property owner is doing a nice job.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Stover, to recommend to the State Nominations Review Committee that the Schroeder-Kleine Grocery Company Warehouse; M.M. Walker Company Warehouse National Register of Historic Places Nomination is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places based on criteria A and C. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

2010 City of Dubuque Regional NAPC CAMP: Staff Member Johnson reviewed the NAPC Camp brochure. He explained the registration to date has been slow; however, if registration numbers are low that would provide an opportunity for a more focused CAMP experience. Staff Member Johnson noted all Commissioners are already registered for the CAMP and expected to attend. Commissioner Wand noted he will not be able to attend, but he made staff aware of that some time ago.

Building Services Historic Preservation Enforcement Report Update: Staff Member Johnson noted there are no updates at this time to the Enforcement Report. Staff explained that the property owner at 950 Spruce Street did make repairs to the limestone foundation on the south side of the building. Staff noted the quality of that work could be questioned.

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

September 16, 2010

Page 6

The Commission discussed the repointing and felt the work was good enough so that the building was no longer suffering from demolition by neglect, and the property could be taken off the enforcement report.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 6:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Laura Carstens, Planning Services Manager

Adopted—October 21, 2010

f:\users\kmunson\wp\boards-commissions\hpc\minutes\hpc minutes 2010\hpc min sep 16 2010\hpc min sep 16 2010.doc