



Approved

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, March 18, 2010
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Vice Chairperson Chris Wand, Commissioners David Klavitter, Chris Olson, Joseph Rapp and Bob McDonell.

Commissioners Excused: Commissioners John Whalen, Michael Knight, Mary Loney Bichell and Peggy Stover.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens and Dave Johnson.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairperson Wand at 5:30 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: The Commission noted a correction to Page 4 of the February 18, 2010 minutes. The Commission noted the first sentence in paragraph 5 should read, "The Commission questioned why the applicant wanted the building removed from the Brewery Conservation District."

Motion by Olson, seconded by McDonell, to approve the minutes as amended. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Rapp, Wand and McDonell, Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Gene Melssen for a Certificate of Appropriateness/ Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Fund to repair the roof on the building located at 3040 Elm Street in the Brewery Conservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, noting the building's condition, the proposed work and two bids received for Phase 1 of the project. He explained the applicant's intent is to initially repair the hip roof portion of the building. He stated the applicant explained that the flat roof area adjacent to and east of the tower as well as the tower will be repaired immediately following the hip roof portion. He stated that the Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Fund Committee has met and recommends funding up to \$25,000 for the entire project. Staff Member Johnson noted the committee will require bids be submitted for review for the later phases of the project.

Gerry Charley, 2745 Cottonwood Court, presented the application. Mr. Charley explained he is the property manager for the building. He noted the project is planned to begin with the hip roof and then proceed with the flat roof and steeple.

Motion by Wand, seconded by McDonell, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness and up to \$25,000 in Historic Preservation Revolving Loan funds, as proposed, subject to Planning Services staff review and approval of the materials prior to installation. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Rapp, Wand and McDonell, Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of D & J Realty, Dennis & Joe Hefel for a Certificate of Appropriateness/Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Fund to remodel the storefront located at 163 Main Street in the Old Main Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He reviewed the proposed changes to the storefront. He explained the approval had previously been given to the property owner to open the upper story windows to the original size and install wood, vinyl or aluminum clad windows that were the same type, shape and style as the original. Staff noted that approval was to be consistent with the Historic Preservation Commission Window Policy. He noted the 2001 rendering prepared by Main Street Iowa Architect Tim Reinders provided by the applicant. The Commission noted the applicant was not in attendance.

The Commission discussed the proposed Low E glass transparency. Staff Member Johnson explained his conversation with the applicant was that the glass in the storefront would have the typical slight greenish hue that Low E glass has; however, the glass will be transparent and will not be reflective.

The Commission discussed the window replacement on the upper story of the building. The Commission felt the new windows were not appropriate and not consistent with the Window Policy, which allows windows to be replaced that are the same size, style and shape as the original. The Commission noted the original windows would have been a two-part window and not a three-part window as was installed. The Commission required the three-part windows be removed and replaced with a two-part window, which are the same type, shape and style as the original windows.

The Commission clarified that the windows and transoms will be the same size all across the storefront. Staff Member Johnson noted that the storefront will not have traditional size transoms; rather, two large 10' by 10' panes of glass with metal trim have been proposed. He clarified that those windows and flashings will be the same size and align across the storefront.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Klavitter, to approve the request with the following conditions:

1. Follow the Window Policy and replace with windows that mimic the ones to the north.
2. The plate glass on the storefront must stay the same height.
3. The glass on the storefront must be transparent.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Rapp, Wand and McDonell, Nay – None

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Dubuque County Historical Society for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a Lead Mine Exhibit located at 2241 Lincoln Avenue (Ham House Landmark).

Commissioner Rapp excused himself from discussion due to a conflict of interest.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He reviewed the proposed work and materials for the lead mine exhibit at the Ham House site. He explained the photos of the site.

Commissioner Olson noted she had a conversation with Dubuque County Historical Society Executive Director Jerry Enzler regarding permit review for landmarks and landmark sites.

Commissioner Wand noted his firm, Durrant, prepared the drawings, but he did not participate and he was not aware of the project, and therefore felt he did not have a conflict of interest.

Jerry Enzler, Dubuque County Historical Society Executive Director, reviewed the history of the Ham House and the consultants the Historical Society has retained for the project. Mr. Enzler also reviewed future site improvements for the grounds. He noted the restoration of the Ham House and the addition of other historic buildings on the site. He explained the long range plan is to install historically appropriate plantings and interpretive signs. He introduced Mark Hantelmann.

Commissioner Klavitter asked about the work in progress before the Historic Preservation Commission had a chance to review it. Staff Member Carstens explained review of work in historic districts and landmark sites is triggered by the building permit process. She explained the City's permit software is intended to flag building permit applications for properties located in historic districts and local landmarks. She explained staff learned after the fact that the City landmarks were not flagged in the software, and the Historical Society inadvertently did go through the proper review procedures prior to obtaining the building permit. She noted the problem has been remedied.

Staff Member Johnson asked whether any safety barriers are planned at the top of the

exhibit. He noted the top of the exhibit is approximately 10-12 feet from the parking lot surface. Mark Hantelmann explained there is a rock barrier proposed at the top of the exhibit to prevent falls.

The Commission noted that if the Building Department determines City Code would require a barrier other than the proposed rock barrier, an unobtrusive fence system should be considered. The Commission noted possible materials such as hoop railings, unobtrusive metal railings or wire systems. The Commission noted if a fence system would be required, it should be painted black so it would disappear from a distance.

The Commission agreed the exhibit setting does not detract from the Ham House and the collection of other structures on the property lends to the exhibit. The Commission discussed the actual exhibit appearance versus the model's appearance. Mr. Enzler clarified that the slope will be more natural rather than the limestone wall that appears in the application.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Wand, to approve the request, noting the changes discussed at the meeting:

1. The stone wall will be replaced with an earthen structure instead of the proposed dry stacked limestone blocks.
2. The drop-off will be protected with a Code-compliant railing if required by the City Building Code and the Historic Preservation Commission will defer to staff approval of the railing design with the suggestion to consider the hoop style metal railing used on the West 11th Street Historic District retaining walls.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Wand and McDonell, Nay – None; Abstain – Rapp.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Betty Smith for a Certificate of Appropriateness/ Historic Preservation Housing Grant to install a new roof at 1157 Bluff Street located in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, noting the proposed work, materials, grant request, and recommendation of the Historic Preservation Housing Grant Committee. He distributed photos of the property.

Betty Smith, 1157 Bluff Street, reiterated she is asking approval for a new flat roof for her property.

Motion by Wand, seconded by McDonell, to approve the request as submitted, and concur with the recommendation of the Historic Preservation Housing Grant Committee to fund up to \$3,400 for the project. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson,

Rapp, Wand and McDonell, Nay – None.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC:

Historic Millwork District Streetscape Plan: Staff Member Carstens reviewed the need for streetscape changes from the original design due to comments from the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) and the Complete Streets requirements. She introduced the consultant team and Engineering staff.

Greg Roth, V & K, reviewed the PowerPoint presentation of the changes from the Historic Preservation Commission's previous review and timeframe. He discussed the TIGER grant requirements, the changes in streetscape and street paving, what does not change, why changes are needed, the conflicting interest and requirements of the grants, and revised decisions as to plantings in planters and various streetscape elements: lighting, trash receptacles, bike racks, bus shelters, and benches.

Commissioner Olson suggested permanent planters, similar to what is used at the Roshek Building, would be a good example to review with SHPO.

Will Page, Historic Preservation consultant, reviewed the character-defining features of the Historic Millwork District. He noted density of development, building materials, hard textures, height, industrial design, restricted color palette, rectilinear layout of streets and buildings, railroad tracks, docks and doors, irregularity of curb lines, signage, and absence of vegetation. He explained these character-defining features need to be taken into consideration as they certainly will be by the State Historic Preservation Office.

Greg Roth, V & K, reviewed the impact of the TIGER grant on the use of brick pavers. He reviewed the revised design for Jackson Street, which re-uses Purington pavers between the rails and approximately 8" along each side of the rails. He explained concrete will be used in the travel lane and permeable pavers in parking areas. He reviewed the simplified design for Washington Street. He reviewed ADA compliant pavers as key issues at intersections. He noted the Complete Streets requirements that prohibit the use of Purington pavers in a number of travel-way locations. He clarified that 10th Street will match the Washington Street concept. He discussed using colored concrete pavers for intersections that need to meet Complete Streets requirements. He noted the pavers are ADA compliant.

Ed Freer, JJR, reviewed the need to find a balance between curb appeal and respect for the past in the designs. Mr. Freer noted based on SHPO comments, less trees and vegetation are proposed. He noted the number of opportunities to introduce the industrial aesthetic to the district. He reviewed the permeable pavements and public art and vegetation proposed in the district. He referred to Faneuil Hall and Quincy Market examples. He noted their historic setting and modern day uses. He noted that the vegetation that was introduced into these sites is a large component of what makes them successful urban places. He noted that the Quincy Market examples show the introduction

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

March 18, 2010

Page 6

of social interaction, urban opportunities, vegetation and urban design. He explained the vegetation also provides canopy shade in some locations. He noted that places of significant historical value such as the Historic Millwork District can use restrained vegetation and streetscape amenities as benefits to an area. Mr. Freer reviewed 25 historic warehouse districts around the country that utilize successful balance of curb appeal that accommodates adaptive re-use.

Staff Member Carstens noted the goal of the Commission is to find consensus on how vegetation and streetscape amenities can be properly introduced into the Millwork District.

Commissioner Rapp asked if any rooftop gardens are utilized in the national examples that were noted. Mr. Freer stated limited green roofs are currently in place; however, he anticipates their use more in the future.

Mr. Freer reviewed the proposed luminaire fixtures, benches, trash receptacles, bicycle racks, bus shelters and other amenities.

Mr. Roth reviewed the next steps of the project. He noted the time constraints with the grants.

Commissioner Wand noted the importance of considering bike safety and ADA concerns with the brick pavers. He liked how the concept incorporated the pavers into the tracks and cautioned how they are installed so bike tires cannot get caught in between them. He suggested not doing any streetscape improvements on Elm Street in anticipation of that street being realigned at a later date. He felt savings from that could be incorporated into other areas of the project.

Commissioner Wand questioned whether the one-way streets on 9th and 11th will be converted to a two-way street. Jon Dienst, City of Dubuque Civil Engineer, stated it is still under study and review with the Iowa Department of Transportation (IDOT). He explained the City is currently meeting with property owners and other interested parties.

Commissioner Wand noted he supported the use of pavers at intersections. He stated he would support using the Purington pavers at intersections instead of a substitute paver material. He suggested a simplified brick layout rather than the mixed herringbone pattern. Mr. Roth noted the proposed design was chosen because it will hold up better to traffic demands. He noted the preference of SHPO would be to utilize the Purington pavers as well, but cautioned that the IDOT most likely will not allow them at intersections.

Commissioner Wand suggested not restricting anything with the proposed plantings. He stated he liked the number and density of what was proposed. He supported the hanging light fixtures, but stated the pole mounted light fixtures will appear dated quickly. He explained it would be important to find a balance between the historic industrial fixture and an ornate fixture. Commissioner Olson stated she supported the hanging fixture as well,

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

March 18, 2010

Page 7

but did not like the pole-mounted fixture. Will Page stated he preferred the hanging fixture and disagreed with the proposed pole-mounted fixture. Commissioner Wand suggested looking at historical photographs of the Millwork District which show lighting fixtures. Mr. Freer noted the pole-mounted fixture is actually narrower than what is depicted in the slide, and suggested viewing the fixture in person. Commissioner Wand expressed concern about the illumination from the fixtures. He recommended cut-off luminaires and shields.

Commissioner Wand expressed concern about the bike racks and whether people would be able to identify them as bike racks. He stated he liked the simplicity and unobtrusiveness of the rack, but cautioned people may not recognize them as a bike rack and therefore not use them. He stated he would support the bike racks if they were grouped. Commissioner Olson also expressed support for the bike rack and felt that they were a good unobtrusive design. Mr. Roth noted the bike racks actually come with a small bicycle decal on them.

Commissioner Olson stated she felt the proposed trash receptacles were too contemporary and look as though they would be more appropriately located in the interior of a building. She stated they appeared too delicate looking for the Millwork District. Commissioner Klavitter noted the receptacles would be out of place with the benches.

Commissioner Klavitter supported the benches and noted the design would fit in well with the Millwork District.

Commissioner McDonell concurred with the lighting comments and suggested more continuity with the lighting fixtures. He stated he agreed with the receptacle concerns.

Commissioner Rapp questioned whether historic millwork products once made in the district could be used as art features in public spaces in the district. Staff Member Carstens reviewed that the art component of the Historic Millwork District Master Plan does incorporate those concepts, but the District does not have a specific art plan in place at this time. She said she would share Commissioner Rapp's suggestion with an art and culture group who will be looking at the Millwork District.

Mr. Roth noted people are currently considering using millwork equipment as a feature in Foundry Square. Commissioner McDonell stressed that if permanent fixtures are used, it is critical that they fit in with the district. He suggested local artists be used if rotating art is the direction of the district. Mr. Freer stated they are trying to incorporate the public amenities and functions in a subtle, non-trite manner that does not compete with fine art.

The Commission suggested a better connection between benches and the trash receptacles. The Commission noted the receptacles should be simpler in design. Consensus was the trash receptacles should be metal, all one dark color, or wood and dark metal.

The Commission agreed that there is an adaptive change in use in the district which brings on new needs and therefore the vegetation is important to creating a livable place. The Commission suggested not restricting any more vegetation. The Commission favored opportunities to increase the number of trees and vegetation throughout the district as long as they were located appropriately.

Mr. Freer noted that columnar trees will be used by the arched loading docks and will not obscure anything. Staff Member Carstens reviewed the City's streetscape and landscape guidelines for historic districts support vegetation as long as it does not obscure the view of building details or damage a building. Consensus was agreement with the proposed plantings and trees, because it is restrained and compatible with the District's change in use with the introduction of residential, if it is reversible, and it creates livable spaces.

The Commission suggested using Purington pavers at the intersections, if possible. The Commission agreed that if this is not possible, modern brick pavers would be the next acceptable alternative followed by concrete pavers. The Commission agreed they liked the suspended Caternary illuminaire, but would choose a pole-mounted style more in keeping with the district as long as there is a connection between the hanging and pole-mounted styles. The Commission agreed they supported the bicycle racks with the details that will delineate them as bike racks. They suggested grouping the bike racks as well. The Commission supported the option that the benches have a back and no back. Staff Member Dienst explained the City is currently considering using local contractors to develop the benches and incorporating salvaged material into the benches. The Commission suggested using the manufacturer of the benches to also manufacture a more simplified receptacle style. The Commission agreed the receptacles should be dark in color, simple, and more utilitarian. The Commission supported the proposed street and sidewalk concepts.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION:

Historic Preservation Housing Grant and Revolving Loan Fund Applications: The Commission requested future staff reports include the amount of remaining funds in the Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Fund and the Historic Preservation Housing Grant.

Work without a Permit: The Commission requested future staff reports note when an applicant has started work without obtaining the necessary approvals and review.

Four Mounds White House Columns: Commissioner Olson provided the Commission with an update of the column repair at the White House at the Four Mounds Estate. She noted a previous presentation to the Commission that requested feedback on replicating the columns using a cast resin material. She explained Four Mounds will first attempt to repair the columns. She stated if that doesn't work, Four Mounds will pursue the resin alternative. The Commission and staff discussed whether the Commission formally reviewed and

approved that request. Staff Member Johnson stated he would follow-up with the Commission.

1090 W. 3rd Street: Commissioner Klavitter distributed a historical image and current photograph of his house located at 1090 W. 3rd Street. He explained he wishes to replace the walk-out porch railing located above the corner entrance of the home. He explained the historical image is not of good enough quality to see the historical design. He requested the Commission offer suggestions for rail designs. The Commission noted the railing appeared to be fairly simple in design, although the exact design cannot be determined. Staff Member Johnson suggested a simplified approach that is compatible with features of the home. Commissioner Wand stated the railing was most likely similar to the porch railing of his home. Commissioner Wand provided Commissioner Klavitter with a railing sketch. Commissioner Klavitter stated he is meeting with the previous owners who may have images of the railing. He stated once a design is identified, it will be formally presented to the Commission.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Mines of Spain Exhibit & Education Program: Staff Member Carstens reviewed the concepts for the upper level of the expanded E.B. Lyons Interpretive Center. The Commission suggested avoiding using the color red for the Native American interpretations. Commissioner Rapp noted Junkermann is spelled with two n's.

Architecture Days: Staff Member Jonson referenced the scheduled events for Architectural Days that will take place between April 12-15, 2010. He explained the Commission is encouraged to attend as many events as possible.

Foundation of Historic Rehabilitation Seminar: Staff Member Johnson referred the Commission to the brochure for the Foundation of Historic Rehabilitation Seminar. He reviewed the seminar's events and noted Commissioners may attend the seminar free of charge and should contact the Planning Services Department if they wish to register.

National Historic Preservation Month: Staff Member Johnson explained the theme for National Historic Preservation Month, which takes place in the month of May is, "Old is the New Green." Staff Member Johnson reviewed the purpose of National Historic Preservation Month as well as the list of suggested activities provided by the National Trust for Historic Preservation. He noted that the Mayor will be issuing a proclamation for Historic Preservation Month at the May 3rd City Council meeting. The Commission discussed possible historic locations to hold the May Historic Preservation Commission meeting in recognition of Historic Preservation Month. By consensus, the Commission agreed to first attempt to schedule the meeting at the Carnegie Stout Public Library Auditorium, and if that is not available, attempt to schedule the meeting at the Roshek Building Lobby.

Building Services Dept. – Status Report on Historic Preservation: Staff reviewed the updates to the Status Report on Historic Preservation enforcement.

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

March 18, 2010

Page 10

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 8:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



David Johnson, Assistant Planner

Adopted—April 15, 2010

f:\users\kmunson\wp\boards-commissions\hpc\minutes\hpc minutes 2010\hpc min mar 18 2010\hpc min mar 18 2010.doc