



Approved

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, February 18, 2010
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Michael Knight, Commissioners David Klavitter, Chris Olson, John Whalen, Mary Loney Bichell, Joseph Rapp, Chris Wand, Peggy Stover and Bob McDonell.

Commissioners Excused: None.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens and David Johnson.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Knight at 5:30 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Motion by Wand, seconded by Stover, to approve the minutes of the January 14, 2010 meeting as written. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Knight, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Michelle Brown, Opening Doors for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the south entrance door for property located at 1111 Bluff Street in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He noted the requested changes in the south entrance door and the previously approved Certificates of Appropriateness for the project. He explained the current request is to allow a metal entry system. He explained the metal system is required to accommodate the needed controlled locking system for staff, volunteers and people receiving services in the building. He noted the metal will be painted to match the color of the previously approved AZEK columns. He explained the applicant is requesting a transom again. He noted the applicant took into account the Commission's design concerns with the previous transom and the current transom is more appropriately scaled to the entrance and building.

Greg Welp, 11 Cameron Road, Galena, Illinois, was present by conference call. He explained the need for a metal door for the locking system. He referred to the submitted plans, and noted the need for a header over the door for roof support. He also discussed the full transom.

The Commission discussed the request and had no objections.

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

February 18, 2010

Page 2

Motion by Olson, seconded by Wand, to approve the request as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Knight, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

Commissioner Whalen arrived at 5:35 p.m.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Ken Lin for a Certificate of Appropriateness/Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Fund to remodel the storefronts and construct an ADA access ramp for property located at 1109 Iowa Street, 113 & 115 W. 11th Street in the Jackson Park Neighborhood Conservation District/Downtown Design Guidelines Area.

Ken Lin, property owner, reviewed his application for remodeling the storefronts. He reviewed the materials and finishes. He noted he needed to remove the electrical wiring above the entry to 115 W. 11th Street and explained the changes to the wiring. Mr. Lin also reviewed the ADA ramp at 1109 Iowa Street and proposed railing. Mr. Lin provided material samples of the window flashing and cement board transoms and bulkheads.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He explained Breitbach's Farmers Market Food Store at 1109 Iowa, Lien Oriental and American Food Store at 115 W. 11th Street, and the Asian Gourmet at 113 W. 11th Street will be remodeled. He explained the storefront for the Aragon Tap will not be remodeled at this time. He reviewed the details of the transoms, display windows and bulkheads and doors for the storefronts. He reviewed the proposed materials, finishes and relocation of the electrical service. He noted changes to 115 W. 11th Street door, windows and electrical service. He explained the basement windows to be filled in the alley have already been partially filled in through alley improvements over the years. He reviewed the ramp and the railing.

Staff Member Johnson noted the applicant will be doing some of the work himself; however, parts of the project will be bid to contractors. He explained the applicant has provided the costs of materials for the work to be performed by him and bids from licensed contractors for the work that will be done by the contractors. He explained the program only refunds property owners the cost of materials when they do the work themselves; however, the program will refund the cost of materials and labor when the work is done by a licensed contractor. He explained the Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Fund Committee has recommended the project be funded up to \$25,000 provided the Historic Preservation Commission approves of the design and materials. He reviewed the design guidelines for the project.

Commissioners discussed the request and felt the original materials should be retained to the greatest extent possible rather than potentially covering up materials. The Commission noted that would be consistent with the design guidelines. Commissioners discussed options with the applicant. The Commission suggested Mr. Lin do further research and physical investigation of the building façades in an effort to determine what original materials may still be present. Mr. Lin discussed what research he has done.

Commissioners discussed options for the storefronts. The Commission suggested instead of cement board transoms, if the original transoms were present, or if new windows were to be installed, the back of the glass could be painted a dark color to still offer an appropriate appearance while obscuring the drop-down ceiling behind it. Mr. Lin explained the costs were a significant factor in how the project was designed and planned. He explained the proposed project and materials would allow him to remodel all three storefronts rather than perhaps one.

The Commission further discussed other options for the storefronts, such as cleaning the bases, which appear original. Mr. Lin noted where he needs to add ADA ramps. Commissioners discussed asking for the building Department to allow the original existing tiled entries in the storefronts to remain under the current Dubuque Historical Building Code.

Mr. Lin asked about the location of new mullions for 1109 Iowa Street. The Commission discussed possible configurations. Mr. Lin noted the two large display windows are being replaced with three display windows because of cost. The Commission did not object to three display windows and suggested the vertical or mullion elements of the bulkhead align with the window framing.

Commissioners discussed having a phased project that would involve Planning staff consultation and approval as more is learned about the existing historic materials. Mr. Lin noted he needs to work with the businesses to minimize disruptions to their operations during remodeling. The Commission discussed how the project could be flexible if original materials are found and staff was to work with the applicant throughout the project. Commissioners discussed the potential cost savings of restoring existing materials rather than reconstructing the storefronts. Mr. Lin was agreeable.

Staff Member Johnson asked for clarification on the bulkheads. The Commission's consensus was to retain the original glass and paint the back a dark color if that glass still exists, or frame cement board in such a way as to allow for a future transom window.

Staff Member Johnson asked for clarification on the storefronts. The Commission's consensus was the window trim, bulkhead mullions, and space occupied behind the vertical paneling on 1109 Iowa Street should align.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Bichell, to approve the request and up to \$25,000 in Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Funds with the following conditions:

- 1) Repair the facades on West 11th Street and Iowa Street as proposed, and maintain the historical aspects of the bulkhead to the greatest extent possible;
- 2) Allow three windows for the storefront on 1109 Iowa Street, and align the framing with the bulkhead vertical elements and area above;

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

February 18, 2010

Page 4

- 3) Maintain and repair the original transom materials, and if those materials are gone, cement board is an acceptable material and should be framed in such a way to allow the installation of transom windows in the future;
- 4) Recommend the Building Services Department review the tile entries and preserve those entrances as historic features while still maintaining accessibility.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Olson, to direct staff to coordinate the progress of the project with periodic meetings with Mr. Lin. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

ALTERATION OF A CONSERVATION DISTRICT: Application of LK Development & Storage, LLC/Brian Kane, Kane, Norby & Reddick, P.C. to remove 3040 Elm Street from a Conservation District.

The applicants were not in attendance.

Staff Member Carstens reviewed the history of the project and request from Attorney Brian Kane to remove the property from the Brewery Conservation District. She referenced background information on conservation districts as well as the building. She reviewed the criteria for consideration and historical significance of the property.

A letter in opposition to the request was received and filed.

The Commission questioned why the applicant wanted the building removed from the Brewery Conservation District. Staff explained the letter from Brian Kane asserts that the building is under enforcement for demolition by neglect because it is located in a conservation district. The Commission noted a conservation district does not cause the enforcement action on a building; rather the condition of a building is why the City will pursue enforcement action. Staff and the Commission noted demolition by neglect is not the only means for enforcement on a neglected building and City Code has a number of criteria that can apply.

The Commission noted the only role in this request is to evaluate whether the structure is significant. The Commission noted the building is part of the former Dubuque Brewery and Malting Company complex. The Commission noted those buildings were at one time listed on the National Register of Historic Places, but were delisted in 1978, because of procedural errors. The Commission stated the building has significant historical and architectural importance to the city of Dubuque.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Stover, to recommend City Council not remove 3040 Elm

Street from the Brewery Conservation District based on:

1. The building was once listed on the National Register of Historic Places; and
2. The building currently meets the National Register Criterion A for property that is associated with events and made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history, and Criterion C for property that embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or presents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic value, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction; and
3. The property's association with notable architect Fridolin Herr.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION:

NAPC Camp: Commissioner Olson noted the NAPC CAMP materials in the packet and recommended the Commission hold another session in Dubuque. The Commission noted that the previous NAPC CAMP was a very positive experience and hosting a CAMP allows an opportunity to train all Commissioners without the need for travel. The Commission explained since the last CAMP, there are new Commissioners that would benefit from a daylong CAMP.

Staff Member Johnson asked for input on the topics to be discussed at a day-long session. Commissioners were in support of a regional CAMP, with procedures and hands-on design as optional topics.

Motion by Wand, seconded by McDonell, to host a regional one-day NAPC CAMP in the early fall, on a weekend, and the two additional topics of discussion should be Procedures and Hands-on Design Experience. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

Old House Enthusiasts Grant: Commissioner Olson asked about submitting an Old House Enthusiasts Grant application on behalf of the City for Four Mounds to build missing elements in the Indian Room at Eagle Point Park. Staff Member Carstens recommended Commissioner Olson work with Park Division Manager Bob Fritsch on the application.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Four Mounds Site Plan Draft RFP: Staff Member Johnson reviewed the Four Mounds Illustrated Site Plan project and the Draft RFP. Commissioner Olson invited a Historic Preservation Commission Member to serve on the RFP and Design Committee. Commissioners reviewed the RFP and discussed the types of final products. Commissioner Wand suggested removing the request for one full electronic file package in original format. Commissioner Rapp agreed to serve as Historic Preservation Commission

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

February 18, 2010

Page 6

representative for the project.

2009 CLG and NPS Annual Reports: The Commission received and filed the reports.

Ken Kringle Award Nominations: Staff Member Johnson reviewed the Ken Kringle award criteria and suggested four projects that the Commission may want to consider. The Commission consensus was to nominate 215 E. 22nd Street, 759 Bluff Street, 200 Main Street and 306 W. Locust Street for the 2009 Ken Kringle Historic Preservation Awards.

2010 Preservation at its Best Awards Nominations: Staff Member Johnson reviewed the criteria for nominations as well as the suggested nominations by staff. Commissioners discussed the nominations and by consensus nominated the Hotel Julien under the Large Commercial Category, Step-by-Step under the Residential category, and the Historic Millwork District Master Plan under the Community Effort category for the 2010 Preservation at its Best Awards.

Update on Mines of Spain Exhibit and Education Program: Staff Member Carstens presented the update on the Mines of Spain Exhibit and Education Program. She stated staff will continue to provide updates and concepts for the Mines of Spain exhibits and education programs to the Commission.

Building Services Dept. – Status Report on Historic Preservation Enforcement: Staff Member Johnson explained the scheduled historic preservation enforcement meeting was cancelled and a report will be provided next month.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 7:11 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



David Johnson, Assistant Planner

Adopted—March 19, 2010