



Approved

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, October 19, 2023
City Council Chambers, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Acting Chair Thea Dement, Bill Doyle, Janice Esser, Christina Monk, and Heidi Pettitt

Commissioners Excused: Tim Gau, Melissa Daykin Cassill and Rick Stuter

Commissioners Unexcused: none

Staff Members Present: Wally Wernimont and Chris Happ Olson

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Thea Dement at 5:30 p.m.

MINUTES: Motion by Esser, seconded by Pettitt, to approve the minutes of the September 28, 2023 meeting as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Dement, Doyle, Esser, Monk, and Pettitt; Nay – none.

ACTION ITEMS

DESIGN REVIEW

Applicant: John J. Jaeger
Owner: John J. Jaeger
Address: 1273 Bluff Street
Project: Wrap wood fascia with metal sheeting
District: Jackson Park Historic District

Staff Member Happ Olson presented the staff report with a request to wrap existing wood fascia with aluminum stock on the front of the building. She explained the style and age of the structure noting that it is a pre-1872 building with a monitor style roof, which is a typical style of that period but that there are not many left in Dubuque. The structure has been surveyed several times and most recently as an update to the Jackson Park Historic District in 2004.

Happ Olson noted that Inspection and Construction Services (ICS) contacted her to review a permit request. Upon making a site visit to the property, she observed that the

project was about 80% complete. ICS issued a stop-work order. She referred to photos of the property showing the work under construction and before construction. She described the way the sheet metal was wrapped around the wood fascia and explained the property is a contributing building. She referred to historic imagery of the property including Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps 1891, 1909, and 1950, noting minor changes to the building. She noted that the request is to change from wood to wrapped metal and referred to architectural guidelines. She described that the new product has a sheen and was not installed smoothly, which accentuates the new material in sunlight. She referred to the role of the commission.

John Jaeger, 15672 White Oak Drive of Peosta, apologized for not obtaining the required permit. He routed around photos showing various properties in Dubuque that have aluminum siding, fascia and soffits, as well as examples with preserved original materials. He said that he currently has to paint the fascia every 3-5 years. He referred to photos of City Hall showing aluminum soffit and fascia. He provided a photograph of the site and said that he fixed the wrinkled material after the staff had photographed the site and the stop-work order was placed. Jaeger showed a photo of the aluminum wrapped fascia to the Acting Chairperson.

Commissioner Doyle noted the building is a contributing building to the district and therefore under the Commission's review. He said the photos shown by the applicant with aluminum soffits elsewhere in the downtown do not have bearing to this project.

The Commission asked if the soffit has aluminum wrapping and determined from photography that it is still wood. Commissioner Monk noted that she does not have an issue with fascia board being wrapped, but noted that the soffit was not and that it was referenced in the application.

Acting Chairperson Dement discussed the sheen of the aluminum. She said that a matte finish would be more appropriate. The Commission discussed the sheen of the wrapping of the fascia board.

Happ Olson discussed that a material change in appearance triggers review by the Historic Preservation. The Commission discussed aluminum use as a drip edge for the building.

Motion by Monk, second by Doyle, to approve the application to wrap the fascia board with a dark matte color aluminum stock using a smooth finish installation, with a condition that wrapping of the soffit is not approved. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Monk, Dement, Doyle and Pettitt; Nay- Dement; Nay- none; Abstain- Esser.

DESIGN REVIEW

Applicant: Sandeep (Sonny) Shelke
Owner: 437 Loras Blvd Apartments LLC
Address: 437 Loras Boulevard
Project: Modification of previous Notice of Decision

District: with modified window scope of work.
West 11th Street Historic District

Staff Member Happ Olson presented the staff report noting style of structure and a previous design review conducted on July 21, 2022. She referred to those materials attached to the current staff report. She informed the Commission that this block of the neighborhood was damaged by a gas explosion on the adjacent property on August 28, 2020. She reviewed the previous COA for the turret windows.

Happ Olson noted that the applicant was looking for approval to 1) replace the curved painted wood trim on the turret with a smooth paint PVC material, and 2) change to vinyl windows on the west side, east side (minus any leaded glass or wood tracery windows, and minus those two facing Loras Boulevard). As well, the applicant has already restored the wood tracery window at the front of the structure and has since found the three tracery windows that were previously installed in the turret attic space and offered to restore and replace those as well. The applicant wishes to remove the plexiglass and restore the window in east facing gable. Happ Olson referred to photos of windows in the staff report and pointed to which would remain wood and which were desired to be replaced with vinyl.

Sonny Shelke, 2165 Blackfoot Lane, Asbury, and Steven Gates, 357 E. 5th Street, East Dubuque spoke at the podium. Mr. Gates stated that the wood banding is made of three different moldings and that there have been performance issues. Commissioners Monk and Doyle offered suggestions for addressing performance. Mr. Sandeep said he is going to repaint the entire property.

Mr. Sandeep discussed the visible windows that are closer to the front of the building are going to be wood. He expressed his desire that the windows toward the rear would be vinyl. Monk complimented the applicants on the window they restored and replaced on the second floor. Mr. Gates said they would repaint the windows in the turret. He said they would keep the leaded glass windows. He also addressed that he would like the other windows to be vinyl.

Doyle noted that he is in favor of approving the application as submitted. The Commission discussed the property owner making efforts to reinstall some original windows and the visibility of the windows from the public right-of-way. Monk concurred that with the proposal in the application they are adding elements back to the project and restoring original material on the front.

Motion by Doyle, seconded by Esser, to approve the application as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Dement, Doyle, Esser, Monk, and Pettitt; Nay – none.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: none

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION: none

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Planning Services Director Wernimont updated the Commission on the current status of the Dubuque Brewing and Malting complex at 3000 Jackson Street. He stated the developer is working to do stabilization at the structure, including the removal of the roofs on the towers in order to bring them down to the ground for either restoration or reconstruction, if it is possible to do so.

Staff member Happ Olson referred to a letter from John Whalen for his support of the demolition of garage that was already approved to be demolished by the Commission, noting that receipt of the letter came after the previous Commission meeting.

ADJOURNMENT: Motion by Monk, seconded by Esser to adjourn the October 19, 2023 Commission meeting. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Dement, Doyle, Esser, Monk, Pettitt; Nay – none.

The meeting adjourned at 6:47 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Wally Wernimont, Planning Services Manager

December 14, 2023

Adopted