



Approved

MINUTES HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION REGULAR SESSION

DATE: Thursday, October 20, 2022

First Meeting

Second Meeting

TIME: 5:30 p.m. – Site Visit

6:15 p.m. – Meeting resumed

PLACE: 99 Main Street
Inspect rear section

City Council Chambers, 2nd Floor,
Historic Federal Building
350 W. 6th Street, Dubuque, Iowa

Commissioners Present: Vice Chairperson Thea Dement; Commissioners Tim Gau, Alec Gustafson, Christina Monk and Rick Stuter.

Commissioners Excused: Melissa Daykin Cassill, Janice Esser, Bill Doyle & John McAndrews.

Commissioners Unexcused: None

Staff Members Present: Chris Happ Olson and Matt O'Brien, with Wally Wernimont

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairperson Thea Dement at 5:30 p.m. at 99 Main Street. Staff Members Happ Olson and O'Brien were present. Commissioners toured the site, led by applicant Mike Stickley, of Stickley Morton Architecture. He summarized the condition of the building and answered Commissioners' questions.

ADJOURNMENT: Vice Chairperson Dement adjourned the meeting at 5:45 and announced the meeting would reconvene at 6:15 at the City Council Chambers.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was reconvened at 6:15 PM in the City Council Chambers by Vice Chairperson Dement. Roll call was held again, with the same members present, including Staff Members Happ Olson and O'Brien.

MINUTES: Motion by Gustafson seconded by Gau to approve the minutes of the September 15, 2022 meeting as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Gau, Gustafson, Monk, Stuter and Dement; Nay – none.

ACTION ITEMS:

DEMOLITION PERMIT – tabled from July 21, 2022

Location: 99 Main Street – rear section only
Applicant: Mike Stickley
Owner: Jeff Burds
Project: Demolish rear/west half of building
Request for application
District: Downtown Neighborhood Conservation District

Staff Member Happ Olson presented the staff report noting the property is located in the Downtown Neighborhood Conservation District. The original demolition permit request was provided to the Commission in July and then tabled at the applicant's request. Happ Olson explained that at the time, the Commission evaluated the building to be historically and architecturally significant.

Happ Olson referred to the packet which includes material from the previous request and the new material submitted for the purpose of obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition, based on an economic non-viability criteria. She referred to the photographs and historical research. She also referred to the new material supplied to demonstrate economic non-viability of the structure. The Commission did not have any questions for staff.

Applicant Mike Stickley, of 206 Bluff St., provided information on deterioration and economic non-viability of the rear/west half of 99 Main Street to the Commission. Commissioner Monk asked if the clerestory/monitor will remain on the front section. Stickley stated that it will remain.

Happ Olson stated that the Commission needs to make motions on both historic and/or architectural significance to determine whether a permit can be granted. The Commission members discussed their general agreement that the building was architecturally and historically significant. The Commission and staff discussed the relative rarity of liveries this old in Dubuque that retain so many original features. and economic non-viability when deciding on demolition permit request. Gustafson asked if the buildings are in a historic district. Happ Olson stated that the buildings are in a National Historic District, but not in a local historic district. The review is coming before the Commission because of the building's location in a conservation district.

Happ Olson explained that after determining its significance, if they deny demolition, they will consider the economic non-viability argument. She reminded the Commission, that they need consider only the demolition and not what is proposed to be rebuilt.

Motion by Monk, seconded by Gustafson to approve the demolition permit request for reason of architectural and historical significance of building. Motion denied by the following vote: Aye – none; Nay – Gau, Gustafson, Monk, Stuter and Dement.

Motion by Gau, seconded by Gustafson to approve the demolition permit request of the rear/west half of 99 Main Street for reason of economic non-viability. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye –Gau, Gustafson, Monk, Stuter and Dement; Nay – none.

DESIGN REVIEW

Location: 1450 Iowa Street
Applicant: Tom Kelzer/Gary Carner
Owner: GT Development LLC
Project: Restoration & rehabilitation of house; Replacement of garage
District: Jackson Park Historic District

Staff Member Happ Olson presented the staff report noting the request to approve the design for the restoration and rehabilitation of 1450 Iowa Street with replacement of garage in the Jackson Park Historic District. GT Development LLC plans to bring the building back into use by creating a single-family home with the potential for a rental unit on the top floor, the location of the historic conservancy. She referred to the application supplement which outlines all the items in the request. She noted that the supplement outlines some items that met the architectural guidelines that were approved in house prior to the meeting, where there was no material or design change.

She went through the project, item by item, including the new windows, chimney work, roof work, demolition of the existing garage, and rebuilding a new garage. Previous information provided to the Commission in 2020 included historic significance of property, a condition report, and visuals of garage at that time. Happ Olson stated that the house is historically significant and referred to the many surveys. The garage is not identified as a contributing building according to Happ Olson, referring to the different surveys and omission in the Iowa State Inventory Form in 2004. She informed the members that the Commission in 2020 indicated that the loss of the garage would not impact the historic significance of the house.

The Commission discussed the items in the new request. The Commission did not have questions for Happ Olson.

Applicant Tom Kelzer, 9565 Royal Wood Drive, Peosta, provided a summary of the restoration and rehabilitation project at 1450 Iowa. Kelzer represents GT Development, LLC. Vice Chairperson Dement asked Kelzer if he looked into slate to replace the roof. Kelzer stated that type of slate is hard to obtain and is costly. Kelzer wants to appeal to first-time home buyer market. Commissioner Stuter asked if the chimneys are still intact. Kelzer stated that the one in the north seen in the alley no longer exists. Happ Olson noted that the ornate front chimney is not like the others, which appear to have been truncated in the past.

Applicant Kelzer stated that a new garage would be same depth as existing garage with frame structure and set back six feet from the lot line in order to meet code. He noted there would be a gabled roof, likely 4 over 12 pitch, with the same shingle proposed for the house.

The Commission discussed each point of the proposed project. The Commissioner consensus was that the preferred material of the applicant, the Belmont asphalt shingle, was also preferred by the Commission and staff. Commissioners Monk and Gau approved of the reuse and repair of the Yankee gutters. Vice Chairperson Dement asked for clarification on the windows, and Happ Olson stated that the original windows do not exist, save one remaining six over six wood window. Applicant Kelzer states plan is to use black frame for windows. There was general discussion about the window color and the ability for darker colors to hide imperfections and variation in materials.

Planning Services Manager Wally Wernimont joined the meeting. Happ Olson explained that the garage plan supplied by the applicant with the application was mistakenly omitted by staff from the packet received by the Commission. Wernimont suggested that the Commission had the opportunity to defer review of the new garage design to staff, in order to ensure that the applicant could proceed with the work. The Commission by consensus agreed with this approach.

Commissioner Monk recalled the previous Commission discussion about the garage in 2020. She stated she was in favor of garage demolition due to lack of historical significance and new garage similar in scale and being set back from alley.

Vice Chairperson Dement initiated discussion on the chimney. She restated that certain chimneys have been altered. She approves of applicant's plans for the chimneys. Staff person Wernimont pointed out water damage issue on exterior. Commissioner Gau stated that he sees no issues with the request.

DESIGN REVIEW: Motion by Gau, seconded by Gustafson, to approve the application as submitted with the following conditions:

- 1) The Belmont style shingle is allowed for the roof on the house and garage; and
- 2) Windows must be a non-white exterior color; and
- 3) The existing garage may be demolished, due to its lack of architectural or historical significance, and the new garage design review can be conducted by staff, as discussed by the Commission.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye –Gau, Gustafson, Monk, Stuter and Dement; Nay – none

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: None

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION: Monk informed the Commission of various Commissioner attendance of the Growing Sustainable Communities conference. Dement noted she was happy to earn an award for app-engagement and that she attended a useful presentations on lowering cost of living through lowering energy use, and sustainability in rental housing.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Happ Olson referred to the two documents circulated about upcoming events for the Black Heritage Survey and the Rockdale Flood.

ADJOURNMENT: Motion by Gau, seconded by Monk to adjourn the October 20, 2022 Commission meeting. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Gau, Gustafson, Monk, Stuter and Dement; Nay – none

The meeting adjourned at 7:22 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Chris Happ Olson, Assistant Planner

December 15, 2022
Adopted