



Approved

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, November 19, 2009

City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Commissioners David Klavitter, Chris Olson, John Whalen, Mary Loney Bichell, Joseph Rapp and Chris Wand.

Commissioners Excused: Chairperson Michael Knight and Commissioners Peggy Stover and Bob McDonell.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens and David Johnson.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairperson Wand at 5:30 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: The minutes of the October 22, 2009 meeting were reviewed. The Commission noted changes to the minutes regarding discussion of the parking ramp design.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Wand, to approve the minutes as amended. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Rapp and Wand; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Chris Miller / 40 Main LLC for an Application to Individually Designate Historic Property located at 44 Main Street.

Vice Chairperson Wand opened the public hearing. Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, noting the role of the Historic Preservation Commission in reviewing the application as well as the criteria for individual historic designation of a property.

No public were present to speak to the item. The public hearing was closed.

Commission Rapp noted spelling corrections to the Iowa site Inventory Form and staff report for John H. Kleine and W. H. Rumpf. Commissioner Rapp requested the Schroeder-Kleine grocer company receipt provided with the staff report be credited to his collection.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Whalen, to recommend approving 44 Main Street as an individually designated historic property, noting the building has a high level of integrity with the exception of the windows that are missing, it has an interesting history and architecture for the City of Dubuque, and the property has been determined individually eligible for listing on the National Register based on distinctive architectural characteristics. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Rapp and Wand; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Chris Miller / 40 Main LLC for an Application for Certificate of Appropriateness to rehabilitate 42-44 Main Street.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report.

Chris Miller, 3211 North Cedar Court, stated the project has been reviewed and approved by the National Park Service and the State Historic Preservation Office as a historic tax credit project.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Klavitter, to approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Rapp and Wand; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Greg Welp / Opening Doors for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a roof and entrances located at 1111 Bluff Street in the Jackson Park Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report.

Greg Welp, 11 Cameron Road, Galena, Illinois, presented the application. Commissioner Whalen asked what the cupola dimensions were. Mr. Welp stated the cupola is 6 feet wide by 2 feet deep and the building is 116 feet wide. The Commission questioned the width of the columns. Mr. Welp responded the columns are 11 ¼ inches across per column. Mr. Welp clarified there are three columns proposed at the corners of the south entrance and single columns proposed at the corners of the proposed north entrance. The applicant confirmed the limestone base on the south entrance is 4 feet high and 2 feet high on the north entrance.

Commissioner Bichell entered the meeting at 6:15 p.m.

The Commission discussed the size of the proposed cupola and an alternative to use two cupolas. The Commission confirmed that the columns used on the north entrance will be the same size as the columns used on the south entrance. The Commission discussed the appropriate placements for two cupolas on the roof.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Wand, to approve the application with the following conditions:

- 1) The columns on the south entrance be similar in size to the columns on the north entrance.
- 2) The stone base on the south entrance remain 4 feet in height, but the stone base on the north entrance be increased to 4 feet in height.
- 3) The two cupolas be the same size as presented in the drawing and be constructed approximately 1/3 of the way in from the ends of the roof ridge.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Rapp and Wand; Nay – None; Abstain - Bichell.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Veenstra & Kimm, Inc. for an Advisory Design Review for

Historic Millwork District Public Improvements located in the Historic Millwork District in the Downtown Design Guidelines District.

Staff Member Carstens reviewed the Dubuque Historic Millwork District Master Plan. She reviewed the history of the Millwork District and five infrastructure layers for sustainability. She reviewed the economics behind the plan, and the three phases and total development outcomes of the plan.

Greg Roth, Veenstra & Kimm, Ed Freer, JJR Inc., and Will Page, Public Historian, presented the proposed public improvements within the district. Mr. Roth reviewed the process for developing the streetscape plans. He explained open houses, meetings, interviews and design charrettes were held to facilitate comments and suggestions from City staff, stakeholders and the public on proposed improvements. Mr. Roth reviewed the feedback from citizens and stakeholders as well as the decisions made from the public input process.

Mr. Freer presented the public improvement concepts for the core area of the Historic Millwork District. He explained the strategies reflect maintaining the historic character of the area as well as introducing sustainable principles. Mr. Freer reviewed Concept 1 and Concept 2 for improvements within the district. He noted the historic brick roadways framed by permeable pavers and brick paver sidewalks. He said the infiltration planters and permeable pavers will help with on-site storm water management. He noted limestone curbing will be used at intersections. He explained trees and planters are strategically placed within the district so they do not interrupt the historical and industrial character of the area. He noted the intersections and pedestrian links will have different accents and patterns to differentiate them from the vehicular areas. Mr. Freer next discussed Concept 2, noting it is substantially the same as Concept 1 with the exception of standard cast in place concrete with brick accent bands being used for the public sidewalk areas.

Mr. Page presented the key historical features of the district and strategies that will be used as the public improvements are implemented.

Staff Member Carstens explained the project is located in the Downtown Design Guidelines area and the role of the Historic Preservation Commission is to serve as an advisory design review body to the City Council for those projects. She noted the Commission is also participating in the Section 106 process as a consulting agency.

The consensus of the Commission was to support Concept 2, noting the number and location of trees are appropriate. Commissioner Wand suggested colored concrete at the crosswalk. The Commission supported the permeable pavers in the parking zones as well as the parallel parking. Commissioner Olson expressed concern about the proposed bump-outs. She noted the pedestrian benefits but had concern about driving and biking around them and that they are not historically accurate. She supported standard concrete sidewalks, noting the colored concrete sidewalks previously constructed in the city of Dubuque have not performed well.

The Commission agreed that standard concrete sidewalks would be appropriate for the Historic Millwork District. Commissioner Wand noted the concrete sidewalks are preferred because they are simple, cleaner and fit in with the district. Commissioner Wand disagreed with

Commissioner Olson's assessment of the bump-outs. He noted that bump-outs are designed as a traffic calming device and force people to slow down, therefore, providing a safer environment for pedestrians. He noted the bump-out could be shortened. Mr. Roth reiterated that the bump-outs force traffic to slow and create a higher level of safety for an anticipated high pedestrian area. Commissioner Klavitter asked about tree species. Mr. Roth noted no tree species have been selected as yet.

Staff Member Carstens noted the next steps of the project. She explained the Commission will be kept informed throughout the duration of the project and future applications regarding the public improvements within the district will be presented to the Commission for their review.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION:

550 Arlington Street: Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff memo.

Commissioner Rapp excused himself from the discussion because of a conflict and left the meeting at 7:10 p.m.

Bethany Golembeski, 399 Sinsinawa Ave., East Dubuque, Illinois, reviewed the past work on the projects at 550 and 570 Arlington Street. She distributed a photo detailing the transition used on the Captain Merry. She noted that the contractors that worked on 570 Arlington Street altered the design to accommodate electrical work and it affected the appearance. She noted that will not happen at 550 Arlington Street, and she will be personally project managing that job. Ms. Golembeski explained the differences between 570 and 550 Arlington Street.

The Commission noted the transition depicted in the photograph of the Captain Merry alleviates their design concerns. The Commission favored the lower profile of the banding element as well as how the horizontal fascia element projects further out from the limestone veneer below it. Commission noted the more similarly matching colors of the materials used in the building of the Captain Merry and the transition is more appropriate as well. By consensus the Commission agreed that the transition used on the Captain Merry would be an appropriate alternative to use on 550 Arlington Street.

Boarded-Up Windows and Doors Ordinance: Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff memorandum. The Commission discussed the buildings that will be potentially impacted and the concerns of the Dubuque Main Street Board. They noted the Board initially supported the ordinance in concept in 2008 and has since changed their mind. The Commission discussed the possible reasons for this. The Commission and staff discussed that the current economy and timing of the ordinance is probably the most significant consideration of the Dubuque Main Street Board.

The Commission discussed the negative impacts of boarded-up windows on neighborhoods. The Commission noted the property owners potentially affected by the proposed ordinance are being considered, but not the effects that boarded-up windows and doors have on neighboring businesses and property owners. The Commission discussed forwarding the proposed ordinance as drafted to the City Council for consideration. The Commission noted the amount of time and effort that City staff and the Commission have invested into this effort. Staff

explained having the support of the Dubuque Main Street Board would be beneficial in moving forward with the ordinance.

The Commission noted that boarded-up windows and doors are not allowed for any extended period of time in residential areas and questioned why the standards would be different in the downtown. The Commission felt the standards should be consistent. Staff Member Carstens explained that the Commission will need to appoint a member to present the recommendations to City Council.

The Commission again discussed the timing of the ordinance and whether a compromise can be reached with the Dubuque Main Street Board. The Commission and staff discussed new funding incentives for downtown housing. The Commission expressed optimism that those funding areas might eliminate some of the existing boarded-up windows and doors in the downtown.

Commissioner Klavitter questioned the genesis of the ordinance. Staff Member Carstens explained the Historic Preservation Commission had concerns with the blighting influence of boarded-up windows and doors in historic districts. She explained at that same time, the City Manager had concerns with boarded-up windows and doors on commercial buildings in the downtown area. Staff noted the City's vacant and abandoned building ordinance arose from those concerns. The Commission discussed having the chairperson and vice chairperson(s) meet with the City Manager to discuss the ordinance and seek his support and advice on how best to proceed.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Bichell, to table the discussion to the December 2009 or January 2010 Commission meeting, pending a meeting with the City Manager. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Bichell and Wand; Nay – None.

Langworthy District: Commissioner Klavitter reviewed the Langworthy Historic District proposed rezoning. He stated the Langworthy Neighborhood Association asked if the Historic Preservation Commission would be able to comment or take a position. Staff noted the Commission's commenting on a proposed rezoning is not within the Commission's powers and duties outlined in the ordinance. Commissioners noted the best course of action is for the neighborhood association to get support from the property owners affected by the proposed rezoning and speak to their City Council representative.

Meeting Minutes: Commissioner Olson expressed concern over how meeting discussion is phrased and reflected in the minutes. The Commission noted it is important for Commissioners to be specific with their discussion of cases and issues. The Commission and staff discussed how the minutes should reflect more of a general discussion rather than a transcript. The Commission's consensus was to make sure discussions and motions reflect criteria and guidelines.

Training: Commissioners discussed the usefulness of the NAPC CAMP training in June 2008. The Commission noted for the same cost, several Commissioners can attend the NAPC forum bi-annual conference in Grand Rapids in July 2010. The Commission discussed how beneficial the NAPC CAMP was in Dubuque. The Commission noted the CAMP offered relevant training opportunities for the entire Commission and staff for the same cost to travel elsewhere. The

Minutes – Historic Preservation Commission

November 19, 2009

Page 6

Commission and staff discussed the importance of training. The Commission stated they will keep in mind future training opportunities, especially for new Commissioners.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Enforcement Report Update: Staff Member Johnson noted updates to the enforcement report are presented in bold type. Commissioners questioned the progress of 624-626-636-638 Arlington Street. Staff explained the progress has been slow but continual. Staff stated the work to date appears to be consistent with the approved Certificate of Appropriateness.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 8:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Laura Carstens, Planning Services Manager

Adopted—December 17, 2009